

AEGLAEUM 28

Annales d'archéologie égéenne de l'Université de Liège et UT-PASP



EPOS
RECONSIDERING GREEK EPIC
AND AEGEAN BRONZE AGE ARCHAEOLOGY

**Proceedings of the 11th International Aegean Conference /
11e Rencontre égéenne internationale**
Los Angeles, UCLA - The J. Paul Getty Villa, 20-23 April 2006

Edited by Sarah P. MORRIS and Robert LAFFINEUR

Université de Liège
Histoire de l'art et archéologie de la Grèce antique
University of Texas at Austin
Program in Aegean Scripts and Prehistory
2007

HOMER AND HISTORY: OLD QUESTIONS, NEW EVIDENCE*

I. The State of the Debate Concerning Composition of the Epics

"Many and ridiculous are the legends of the Greeks," warned Hecataeus at the outset of Greek historiography. An epic poem describing a ten-year siege in which gods and goddesses intervene to deflect or return spears may seem a prime example. To some, Homer's story of a Trojan war has only a slightly greater likelihood of reflecting a core of historical reality than the epic poem of Virgil or the foundation legends of Rome which invoke the Trojan Aeneas plus Romulus and Remus. M.I. Finley famously argued that while there could well have been Bronze Age assaults on Troy, the natures and identities of the combatants were unlikely to have survived centuries of oral transmission. He cited as a possible comparandum the French national epic, the *Song of Roland*, where a small skirmish was transformed by bards into a decisive battle and the participating armies confused. The German *Nibelungenlied* is a similar case, where the main characters were in fact separated by generations, and the location of the catastrophe of the Burgundians was moved from the Rhine to Hungary, perhaps as a consequence of the invasion of the Hungarians in the 10th century. Kral Marko (King Marko), known historically as a Turkish vassal who died fighting in the Turkish army against the Christians in Romania, was later celebrated in the folk songs of the Serbs and other Balkan peoples as a protector of Christians from Turkish violence.¹ Moreover, the great walls of Troy (visible in the 8th-7th century B.C. in the reconstruction of the excavator, M. Korfmann²), of Mycenae and of Tiryns would surely have sparked the poetic imagination as a locus for myth. (Maps locating sites and areas discussed in the text may be found on Pl. I-II). Finley also stressed that the society described by Homer did not resemble that of the Mycenaean palaces.³ Many other Homeric scholars have argued that the depiction of the society presented by the epics corresponds either with Homer's own time (whether considered as the 8th century B.C. or the 7th,⁴ or with a period deliberately

d/
s/

* This paper is dedicated to the memory of Manfred Korfmann, excavator, expositor and protector of Troy. In the Troad his work encompassed the sites surrounding Troy and the preservation of the natural environment through his successful advocacy of the creation of a National park. At Tübingen, Manfred Korfmann through teaching and mentorship inspired a generation of scholars to continue his work.

I am deeply indebted to Jayne Warner, Erin Hayes and Catriona McDonald for suggestions, research and editorial assistance. I am most grateful to Philip Betancourt, Hector Catling, Oliver Dickinson, Robert Drews, Peter Kuniholm, Sturt Manning, Penelope Mountjoy, James Muhly and Thomas Palaima for helpful comments on my initial draft of this paper, and in particular to Erwin Cook and Richard Janko for many penetrating comments and references to the literature on the subject. Such errors as remain are solely mine.

1 For Kral Marko, see P.H. ILIEVSKI, "TI-RI-SE-RO-E and Some Other Mycenaean Names With Augmentative Prefixes," in *Studia Mycenaea* (1988) (1989) 79. It is perhaps worth noting, however, that where an uninterrupted priestly class is committed to the faithful oral rendition of religious texts, as in the case of the Indian Vedas, change is less likely.

2 M. KORFMANN, "Ilios, ca. 1200 BCE–Ilion, ca. 700 BCE," paper presented at the University of Chicago, 6 April 2000; "Troia/Wilusa–2000 Excavations," *Studia Troica* 11 (2001) 26-27.

3 M.I. FINLEY, *The World of Odysseus* (1979) 47; J. BENNETT, "Homer and the Bronze Age," in *New Companion to Homer* 518; O.T.P.K. DICKINSON, "Homer, the Poet of the Dark Age," in I. MCAUSLAN and P. WALCOT (eds), *Homer* (1998) 28; see also I. MORRIS, "The Use and Abuse of Homer," *ClAnt* 5 (1986) 81-138, who argues that nothing in Homer need precede the 8th century B.C. after allowing for the deliberate poetic creation of "heroic distance;" contra: E. COOK, review of I.M. SHEAR, *Kingship in the Mycenaean World and Its Reflections in the Oral Tradition*, in *AJA* 110 (2006) 666-667. Some have thought the account of a great war correct, but the site transposed from elsewhere, for example, Croatia (R.S. PRICE, *Homeric Whispers: Imitations of Orthodoxy in the Iliad and Odyssey* [2006]) or Scandinavia (F. VINCI, *The Baltic Origins of Homer's Epic Tales: The Iliad, the Odyssey, and the Migration of Myth* [2005])!

4 A.M. SNODGRASS, *Archaeology and the Rise of the Greek State* (1977); "The Rise of the Polis. The Archaeological Evidence" in M.H. HANSEN (ed.), *The Ancient Greek City-State* (1993) 30-40; W. DONLAN, "Reciprocities in Homer," *CW* 75 (1982) 173; M.L. WEST, "The Date of the *Iliad*," *MusHelv* 52 (1995) 203-219.

cap.

archaizing and heroically distancing, but only to the extent of about three generations). K. Raaflaub, for example, has argued that the late 9th and 8th centuries B.C. fit the general picture of the society described in the epics as revealed by archaeology and supplied a milieu and value system comprehensible to an 8th century B.C. audience.⁵

Hesiod, Herodotus and Thucydides, on the other hand, all believed that there had been a major expedition against Troy involving almost all of the Greek Bronze Age states, as described by Homer. Indeed Thucydides even accepted the historicity of a ten-year siege and the Greek construction of a defensive wall to protect their forces, but asserted that the wall must logically have been constructed in the first year of the siege rather than the last as stated by Homer.⁶

W.-D. Niemeier believes that a war of the Greeks against Troy occurred, to which a bard or bards added a wholly fictional tale of Achilles and Agamemnon and exploits or incidents involving other heroes.⁷ Anthropological studies, on the other hand, provide instances where names in particular were preserved, such as the names Polynesian Islanders hold in common from a time prior to their voyages of settlement to various islands or the names of who begat whom that begin the Hebrew Bible.⁸ The Spartan king list contained thirty-five names over twenty generations from Heracles to Leonidas who fell at Thermopylae in 480 B.C., but with suspiciously allegorical names at the beginning.⁹ A tombstone on Chios, the reputed home of Homer, lists fourteen generations of ancestors of one Heropythos.¹⁰ Allowing thirty years to a generation would start the chain c. 890 B.C., assuming the list is not a fiction. J. Latacz argues that while bards everywhere alter or create verses to reflect current or recent social structures and physical objects, they have no reason to change names.¹¹ E. Cook has observed in this regard that poets may retain fossilized name-epithet combinations and other phrases, even after language change has rendered them unmetrical, because of their utility and/or the ancient patina they convey, but generally adopt contemporary social structure and dynamics in order to make poems relevant.¹² The Homeric epics contain sixty personal names which do not appear in later texts.¹³ The names of about half the Homeric deities do not appear in the Linear B tablets thus far recovered, while gods mentioned in the tablets do not appear in Homer.¹⁴ Of course even if one believes that Helen and Achilles were the names of living people, whether they were originally part of a Trojan war saga or came from a different story which was subsequently incorporated into the Homeric epic is a separate question.¹⁵

5 K.A. RAAFLAUB, "A Historian's Headache: How To Read 'Homeric Society'?" in N. FISHER and H. VAN WEES (eds), *Archaic Greece: New Approaches and New Evidence* (1998) 169-193; "Homeric Society," in *New Companion to Homer* 624-648; "Homer to Solon. The Rise of the Polis, The Written Sources," in HANSEN (*supra* n. 8) 41-105; "Homer und die Geschichte des 8. Jahrhunderts v. Chr." in J. LATA CZ (ed.), *Zweihundert Jahre Homer-Forschung: Rückblick und Ausblick* (1991) 205-256.

6 Thuc. 1.11.

7 W.-D. NIEMEIER, comment made during an open discussion at the workshop *Mycenaeans and Anatolians in the Late Bronze Age: The Ahhiyawa Question, Concordia University, Montreal, 4-5 January 2006*.

8 W.D. WESTERVELT, *Legends of Ma-ui—a Demi-God of Polynesia and of His Mother Hina* (1910); Gen. 5:1-32.

9 D.W. PRAKKEN, "Herodotus and the Spartan King Lists," *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association* 71 (1940) 471; A.M. SNODGRASS, *The Dark Age of Greece: An Archaeological Survey of the Eleventh to the Eighth Centuries B.C.* (1971) 11. The Philaids of Athens in the 6th century B.C. claimed twelve ancestors starting with Ajax and Hecataeus of Miletus later claimed fourteen human ancestors (12).

10 H.T. WADE-GERY, *The Poet of the Iliad* (1952) 89, 91-92.

11 J. LATA CZ, *Troy and Homer: Towards a Solution of an Old Mystery* (2004; originally published in German as *Troia und Homer* in 2001) 203.

12 E. COOK, personal communication, for which I am most grateful.

13 T.G. PALAIMA, "Mycenological Perspectives on the Ahhiyawa Question," paper presented (and accompanying handout) at the Workshop *Mycenaeans and Anatolians in the Late Bronze Age: The Ahhiyawa Question, Concordia University, Montreal, 4-5 January 2006*.

14 O.T.P.K. DICKINSON, "Was There Really a Trojan War?" paper presented at the *AJA Athens-Greece Society, 9 October 2006*.

15 M.P. NILSSON in his *The Mycenaean Origin of Greek Mythology* published in 1932 summarizes his position as follows: "I know and appreciate the tenacity of folk memory, but I know also how popular tradition is preserved—and confused and remodeled. The remodeling affects especially the chronological relations of the personages, which are changed freely. . . . If good historical tradition is to be preserved, an undisturbed life both in regard to settling and to civilization is an absolute condition, but the downfall of the Mycenaean civilization was a most stormy and turbulent age, and its turmoils, which mixed up the Greek tribes and

It may be useful at the outset to summarize the current state of the debate concerning the manner of composition and transmission of the Homeric epics. The text we have today derives from a stable and standardized text found in Roman era papyri from between c. 150 B.C. and the 7th century A.D. plus some medieval codices written between c. A.D. 900 and 1550. Around 150 B.C., the recension of the Hellenistic scholar Aristarchus, director of the great library of Alexandria in Egypt, excised certain additional verses present in the early manuscripts.¹⁶ The status of the texts before c. 150 B.C. is much less clear and is the subject of intense and enduring debate, revolving principally around what have been termed “oral dictation” *vs.* “evolutionary” models. The first holds that our inherited texts are generally reliable records of an oral recitation by a bard to a scribe sometime in the 8th century B.C., and that it was the bard (or perhaps one of his predecessors) who was known as Homer.¹⁷ The opposing “evolutionary” model posits that our inherited texts are instead the product of long periods of fluid oral and textual transmission, gradually crystallizing (in the terminology of G. Nagy) between the 8th and 6th centuries B.C., before receiving their current essential form under the reign of the tyrant Peisistratus in Athens in the 6th century B.C., but not finally fixed until the late Classical to Hellenistic period. “Homer” thus becomes a collective term for those primarily involved at the outset.¹⁸ These respective views are well summarized by B. Graziosi¹⁹ and S. Reece. A recent article by Reece notes that among younger scholars in the United States, the evolutionary model has almost achieved the status of orthodoxy. Ongoing evolution of the basic texts would arguably explain the surge in popularity of Homeric scenes in vase painting in the late 6th century B.C., the differences between our inherited texts and certain quotations attributed to Homer by classical authors, the various textual versions circulating and available to Hellenistic Alexandrian editors (some of which—the “wild papyri”—disappear after the Alexandrian commentaries), and the late linguistic forms (“Atticisms”) in the texts.²⁰ The 2005 Reece paper cited, however, may be an indication of the beginning of a modest shift in the tide of opinion. Following on the work of R. Janko as well as M.L. West, B. Powell and the late C.J. Ruijgh, Reece sets forth the case for an early written text based on oral dictation. The argument rests on four pillars: 1) the unity of the narratives—of plot, time and characterization, and of devices such as flashback and anticipation, hence the architectural unity of each epic as a whole (which impressed Aristotle as well²¹); 2) the inconsistencies and inconcinnities at various levels

changed their places of settlement, mixed up and confused their traditions, too. The historical aspect of Greek mythology and especially the mythical chronology are products of the systematizing of the myths by poets of cyclical epics and still more the product of rationalization and historicization by the logographers” (M.P. NILSSON, *The Mycenaean Origin of Greek Mythology* [1932] 4).

- 16 R. JANKO, *The Iliad: A Commentary*, Vol. 4 (1992) 20-38, and especially 20-22; S. REECE, “Homer’s *Iliad* and *Odyssey*: From Oral Performance to Written Text,” in M.C. AMODIO (ed.), *New Directions in Oral Theory* (2005) 44 n. 2.
- 17 REECE (*supra* n. 16) 44-45. Proponents of this view in addition to Reece himself include Milman Parry (*The Making of Homeric Verse: The Collected Papers of Milman Parry* [1971] 451), Albert Lord (“Homer’s Originality: Oral Dictated Texts,” *TAPA* 84 [1953] 124-134), Richard Janko (“The Homeric Poems as Oral Dictated Texts,” *CQ* 48 [1998] 1-13), George Goold, David Gunn, Martin West, Barry Powell, Cornelius Ruijgh, Michael Haslam and Minna Skafte Jensen (REECE [*supra* n. 16] 45). H. van Wees and O. Dickinson among others are explicit in preferring a date around 700 B.C. (H. VAN WEES, “Homeric Warfare,” in *New Companion to Homer* 692; O.T.P.K. DICKINSON, personal communication).
- 18 REECE (*supra* n. 16) 45. Raphael Sealey, John Miles Foley, Gregory Nagy, Richard Seaford, Erwin Cook, Thérèse de Vet, Steven Lowenstam and Robert Lamberton, among others, hold this general position.
- 19 B. GRAZIOSI, *Inventing Homer: The Early Reception of Epic* (2002).
- 20 I am indebted to E. Cook for calling the disappearance of the “wild papyri” after the Alexandrian commentaries to my attention, and for much other wise counsel as well. The lack of any reference to Megara, and especially to the claim made in the time of Solon around 600 B.C. of Homeric support for a Megaran claim to Salamis (O.T.P.K. DICKINSON, “The Catalogue of Ships and All That,” in *MELETEMATATA* 210), absent from our version, gives support to the belief in significant ongoing Athenian editing into the 6th century B.C. References to Delphi as a shrine of great wealth and to sites in Thrace colonized during the 7th century may also support the case for ongoing changes or a 7th century B.C. composition (M. DICKIE, “The Geography of Homer’s World,” in O. ANDERSEN and M. DICKIE [eds], *Homer’s World: Fiction, Tradition, Reality* [1995] 29-56), but the oracle may have been wealthy before the beginning of major construction at Delphi and Greek mariners and traders may have known the names of sites prior to the arrival of Greek colonists.
- 21 Aristotle, *Poetics* 1448a-1459b.

embedded in the narratives, at least some of which would presumably have been corrected by editors or redactors had they felt free to do so;²² 3) the absence of multiple versions of the essential stories of the *Iliad* and *Odyssey*, but rather one version of each, with the same characters, story and sequence of episodes,²³ delivered in a generally uniform meter, dialect, diction and style;²⁴ 4) the fixations in time of the essential epic *Kunstsprache*, or art-language, notwithstanding the substitution of Attic forms for Ionic/Aeolic epic forms where no change in meaning or meter was at issue. Reece posits that Mycenaean and Aeolic epic traditions precede the Ionic and concludes (following Janko) that the poems become fixed in Ionia in the 8th century B.C. as a result of oral dictation and transcription at a specific time and place.

Janko is in fact more specific, however, distinguishing between the problems of relative and absolute dates of Homer, on the one hand, and the prehistory of the tradition on the other. In his *Homer, Hesiod and the Hymns*, Janko indicates why he believes that the Homeric epics must have reached fixed form by the 8th century B.C., with Hesiod (given the estimated rate of change of forms) following in the early 7th.²⁵ (If Janko's formula for the rate of formulaic change is accurate, placing the fixation of the Homeric texts in the 6th century would move Hesiod in the 5th century B.C., an impossibility). In Janko's view, the Peisistratid recension in Athens in the 6th century B.C. established the requirement that the epics be recited as a whole rather than in sections favored by performers and the permanent order of the chapters ("Books") of the *Iliad* and *Odyssey*. The prehistory of the epic tradition is a separate question.²⁶ Janko posits that the earliest stratum is Mycenaean, indeed early Mycenaean, followed by Aeolic (including Lesbian, or Eastern Aeolic), East Ionic (with a very few Euboean, *i.e.*, West Ionic elements), and finally a superficial veneer of Attic. The Mycenaean of the Linear B tablets is related to East Greek, close to the dialects of Arcadia and Cyprus in historical times, and less close to the dialects of Attica and Ionia. Aeolic was initially cognate with Dorian and Northwest Greek, and a dialect whose basic traits arose north of the Corinthian Gulf. (The Aeolic interlude is consistent with the evidence of Mycenaean presence and of Bronze to Iron Age continuity in southern Thessaly and East Locris, discussed below at pp. 24-26) As the *Kunstsprache* of the poems develops, the older elements are retained only where they are not metrically the same as the equivalent current phrase and the older version is required to maintain the hexameter, according to Janko.

Of course, the *Iliad* and *Odyssey* may have woven together preexisting tales of raids at various times, or reinterpreted conflicting versions of an expedition.²⁷ The description of the composition of the Greek forces, particularly in the Catalogue of Ships in Book 2 of the *Iliad* is considered by some as a late insertion, possibly 7th century B.C., notwithstanding the fact that places apparently no longer in existence are named, perhaps motivated by a desire to foster or reflect a developing Panhellenic identity.²⁸ In general the dialect of the Catalogue does not

22 The poet Horace famously noted his annoyance when the good Homer dozed, but quickly added that once a speech is uttered it cannot be brought back (*Ars Poetica* 359, 390 quoted in REECE [*supra* n. 16] 57). R. Janko speaks of "too many uncorrected blunders, like the dead man who is carried off groaning at [*Il.*] 13.423" (JANKO [*supra* n. 16] 37).

23 A required sequence in Homeric recitations was enforced in Athens in the 6th century (J.A. SCOTT, "Athenian Interpolations in Homer: Part II. External Evidence," *CP* 9 [1914] 395-409; G. NAGY, *Pindar's Homer: The Lyric Possession of an Epic Past* [1990] 23). E. COOK, *The Odyssey in Athens: Myths of Cultural Origins* (1995) 128-170, argues that the *Odyssey* evolved in its final stages in Athens.

24 REECE (*supra* n. 16) 71.

25 R. JANKO, *Homer, Hesiod and the Hymns: Diachronic Development in Epic Tradition* (1982); see also MORRIS (*supra* n. 3) 81-138.

26 The stratification of the poetic language was first discussed by M. PARRY ("The Homeric Language as the Language of Oral Poetry," *HSCP* 43 [1932] 1-50) and discussed in detail by C.J. RUIJGH ("Le mycénien et Homère," in A. MORPUGO DAVIES and Y. DUHOUX (eds), *Linear B: A 1984 Survey* [1985] 143-190; "D'Homère aux origines proto-mycéniennes de la tradition épique," in J.P. CRIELAARD (ed.), *Homeric Questions* [1995] 1-96).

27 Other great national epics combine events and individuals of different eras; for example, the *Nibelungenlied* combines heroes who lived a century apart.

28 M. FINKELBERG, "Homer as a Foundation Text," in M. FINKELBERG and G.G. STROUMSA (eds), *Homer, the Bible, and Beyond: Literature and Religious Canons in the Ancient World* (2003) 79-85. However, in this regard it is worth noting that, as Thucydides observed, Homer never uses the term Hellenes to refer to all Greeks (G.S. KIRK, *The Iliad: A Commentary*, Vol. 1 [1985] 202), although he refers to Hellas.

differ statistically from the rest of the *Iliad*, as Janko notes, which would suggest instead an 8th century origin at the latest.²⁹

In any case, there is no denying the hold of the story of the Trojan War on Western thought, the profound questions about the nature of historical memory that the epics pose, or the interest generated by recent archaeological and textual discoveries.³⁰ Of course it has long been recognized that the Homeric epics, in their origins in the oral tradition and later redaction, reflect various chronological strata in every aspect, including dialect, nomenclature, social structure and objects described, such as items of dress and military equipment.³¹ Opinions divide sharply on the relative contribution of the Pre-palatial, Palatial, Post-palatial, Protogeometric, Geometric, Orientalizing and Archaic periods to the Homeric epics,³² while some regard “attempts to relate mythical material to specific periods of the Bronze Age a total waste of time.”³³ This paper, while acknowledging that the poetic imagination cannot be confined within the bounds of historical time, examines how discoveries philological, textual and archaeological in recent years impact the ongoing debate.

II. The State of the Debate on the Period of the Trojan War

Ancient historians and records gave various dates for the Trojan War. Herodotus said around 1250 B.C., the 3rd century B.C. Parian Marble tablet 1209 B.C., and Eratosthenes 1183 B.C. Their sources are only partly known. Of course they had available the various Greek king lists, and Eratosthenes is said to have used a list of Egyptian pharaohs. Thucydides says that Melian commissioners informed the Athenians that Melos had been inhabited for 700 years before 416 B.C.³⁴ The king lists (omitting their divine, semidivine and mythical components) and other genealogical compilations all seem to give out in the mid-10th century, which caused A.R. Burn to place the Trojan War around 1010 B.C.³⁵ Thucydides, seen as the most rational and professional of ancient historians, says that the Trojan War occurred sixty years before the Boeotians were driven out of Arne in Thessaly by the Thessalians and eighty years before the return of the Heraclidae/descent of the Dorians into the Peloponnese,³⁶ but does not reveal the source of such putative precise knowledge of events far in the past. I.S. Lemos has noted the consistency of ancient historical traditions placing the Ionian migration 140 years after the sack of Troy.³⁷ The Aeolian migration was uniformly said to precede the Ionian, and the Doric

29 R. JANKO, personal communication of 6 November 2006.

30 The Homer literature is without doubt vast. S. Reese observes that, “in the very fertile field of Homeric studies there were published in the last *year* of the twentieth century more than a dozen new dissertations, two dozen new scholarly books and monographs, and over 250 new articles and reviews in scholarly journals—a total of almost 10,000 pages of text (and that does not include reprints, translations, popular literature, conference talks, or the ever-growing corpus of electronic text on the World Wide Web). From the last *decade* of the twentieth century I have personally collected more than 2,200 titles of new books, monographs, and journal articles—a total of over 60,000 pages of text . . .” (REECE [*supra* n. 16] 43).

31 Indeed, at times the bard seems to describe the same object differently in succeeding passages, for example the shield of Hector is a Bronze Age “neck-to-ankle” (*i.e.*, tower or figure eight) shield one moment and an Iron Age circular (hoplite) shield the next, as if poetic formula and mental image were simultaneously present in the mind of the poet (E.S. SHERRATT, “Reading the Texts’: Archaeology and the Homeric Question,” *Antiquity* 64 [1990] 810; *Il.* 6.117, 7.250).

32 See, *e.g.*, A. SNODGRASS, “An Historical Homeric Society?” *JHS* 94 (1974); SHERRATT (*supra* n. 31) 807-824; E.S. SHERRATT, “The Trojan War: History or Bricolage?” paper presented at the *Mycenaean Seminar, University of London, Institute of Classical Studies, 30 January 2006*.

33 O.T.P.K. DICKINSON, “The Mycenaean Heritage of Early Iron Age Greece,” in S. DEGER-JALKOTZY and I.S. LEMOS (eds), *Ancient Greece: From the Mycenaean Palaces to the Age of Homer* (2006) 116. See also SHERRATT (*supra* n. 32), 2006.

34 Thuc. 5.112. The resulting date falls between the significant Early, Middle and Late Bronze Age settlement of Melos and the Dorian migration of around 900 B.C.

35 SNODGRASS (*supra* n. 9) 12; A.R. BURN, “Dates in Early Greek History,” *JHS* 55 (1935) 131, 146.

36 Thuc. 1.12.

37 I.S. LEMOS, “The Migrations to the West Coast of Asia Minor: Tradition and Archaeology,” in J. COBET, V. VON GRAEVE, W.-D. NIEMEIJER and K. ZIMMERMANN (eds), *Frühes Ionien. Eine Bestandsaufnahme. Panionion-Symposium Güzelyağl 26. September-1. Oktober 1999 (Milesische Forschungen 5, forthcoming)* 713.

to follow. A Trojan war around 1000 B.C., the date of the burning and possible destruction horizon at Troy at the end of Troy VIIb₃, would seem too late to fit this schema, although perhaps an element of uncertainty may exist regarding a difference in date between the beginning of the migration and its completion in bulk.³⁸ (Of course the account of Thucydides contradicts the Homeric narrative, which places the Boeotians settled in Boeotia at the time of the Trojan War, and the Dorians already in Argos and Sparta.)

The *Iliad* speaks of two attacks on Troy, the first a matter of a raid by six ships led by Heracles,³⁹ and of a sack of Pylos by Heracles in the years before the Trojan War, in which eleven of the twelve sons of Neleus were killed.⁴⁰ S. Hiller would identify the two attacks on Troy recounted in the *Iliad* with the destructions of Troy VIh and Troy VIIa,⁴¹ about a century apart (whereas the *Iliad* places Heracles in the generation before the Trojan expedition). Others have questioned whether any of the destruction levels at Troy can be interpreted convincingly as caused by warfare.⁴² T. Bryce proposed that a series of raids over the course of 100 years had been conflated into a ten-year struggle.⁴³ The late Manfred Korfmann, the excavator and foremost explicator of Troy, came to believe on the basis of correspondences with the Hittite texts and his archaeological investigations, which disclosed evidence of burning, some skeletons and heaps of slingstones, that the war of which Homer spoke came at the end of Troy VIIa around 1200-1180 B.C., but also noted that the remains of Troy in the 8th century would have still closely matched the descriptions in the *Iliad*.⁴⁴

One line of argument offers support for placing the origin of the Homeric epics either before or after the age of the Mycenaean palaces (c. 1400-1200 B.C.). The epics know nothing of palatial bureaucracy and its officials, use of writing for administration, palatial cultic or burial practices, specialization of palace industries, terms for specialized workers of the Linear B tablets, production for export (e.g., of perfumed oil, wine or textiles) or of other aspects of the Mycenaean Palatial period of the 14th-13th centuries B.C. Descriptions of shrines, including that of Delphi as a wealthy shrine, appear to fit later periods.⁴⁵ Suggestions that the descriptions of buildings and other aspects of life in the epics are compatible with the Mycenaean palaces and palatial life seem unconvincing.⁴⁶ Consider the standard of value employed in the epics, where value is measured in numbers of oxen, e.g., gold armor 100 oxen, bronze armor nine, a serving maid twenty.⁴⁷ Such a standard seems possible for Greece in the Early Iron Age, given the very large number of small figurines of cattle at the sanctuary at Olympia, the great increase in pastoralism in Early Iron Age Messenia which added significant amounts of cattle (and deer) to the diet in Nichoria, and the report by Pausanias of a local tradition that the First Messenian

38 M. Korfmann believed the evidence indicated a destruction level. M. Basedow sees instead an indication of ritual burning at a shrine, an interpretation generally regarded by the Troy excavation team as less likely, given the extent of the fire destruction (KORFMANN [*supra* n. 2, 2000]; KORFMANN [*supra* n. 2, 2001] 26-27; M. BASEDOW, this volume; E. PERNICKA, personal communication).

39 *Il.* 5.640-642.

40 *Il.* 11.689-693.

41 S. HILLER, "Two Trojan Wars? On the Destructions of Troy VIh and VIIa," *Studia Troica* 1 (1991) 145-154.

42 See, e.g., M. BASEDOW (*supra* n. 38).

43 T. BRYCE, *The Kingdom of the Hittites* (1998) 392-404.

44 KORFMANN (*supra* n. 2, 2000); KORFMANN (*supra* n. 2, 2001); personal communication on site; M. KORFMANN, "Troia," in *Der neue Pauly* 12:1 (2002) 853; re: dates, see P.A. MOUNTJOY, "Local Mycenaean Pottery at Troia," *Studia Troica* 7 (1997) 259-267; "Troia VII Reconsidered," *Studia Troica* 9 (1999) 295-301, 322-324, 333-334. The possibility that the Phrygians had begun their journey from the Balkans into Anatolia and the tradition recorded in Strabo (7.3.2) that the Phrygians killed a king of Troy are discussed in J. MUHLY, "The Phoenicians in the Aegean," in *MELETEMATIA* 519.

45 *Il.* 9.405-407; *Od.* 8.80.

46 See, e.g., COOK, review of SHEAR (*supra* n. 3) 666-667; I.M. SHEAR, *Tales of Heroes: The Origins of the Homeric Texts* (2000); *Cf. Od.* 17.294-300, which describes how Odysseus' dog Argos lay neglected in dung collected before the gates of Odysseus' palace in Ithaca; see also DICKINSON (*supra* n. 3) 28. The palace of Alkinoos of the Phaiakes described in the *Odyssey* resembles more an Assyrian palace of the 8th-5th centuries B.C. than any Mycenaean palace or Early Iron Age structure in Greece (E. COOK, "Near Eastern Sources for the Palace of Alkinoos," in C. WITT (ed.), *Worlds in Collision* [forthcoming]).

47 Glaukos' golden armor is worth 100 oxen, while Diomedes' bronze armor is worth only nine (*Il.* 6.234-236) and Telemachos' maid Eurykleia was bought by Laertes for twenty oxen (*Od.* 1.429-431).

War between Spartans and Messenians began over a dispute about a herd of cattle.⁴⁸ It is impossible, however, to imagine the palatial administration reflected in the Linear B tablets operating on such a standard.⁴⁹

One further argument favors an origin for certain aspects of the poems in periods prior to Mycenaean palatial civilization. Evolving knowledge of Linear B has led to the widespread belief that both the hexameter of the epics and the roots or origins of a number of word forms employed predate the Greek of the Linear B tablets of the Palatial period.⁵⁰ Latacz, following P. Wathelet, Ruijgh, and Janko, has argued strongly that the original forms of some words or phrases employed in the epics must go back to the 16th-15th century B.C. "according to indisputable linguistic laws."⁵¹ Others, however, have been far more skeptical, both with regard to the word forms and hexameter verse itself.⁵² As to hexameter, Janko believes that hexameter is best explained as a conflation of two Aeolic line forms, and that it develops from Indo-European prototypes rather than Minoan (see below), but accepts that a number of half-lines in Homer may derive from Early Mycenaean phrasing used in earlier meters out of which hexameter develops.⁵³ The recent trend of philological debate has tended toward acceptance of the proposition that pre-Linear B forms can be discerned beneath certain otherwise inexplicable usages in Homer.

In addition, art historians have proposed that the scenes represented in the Thera wall paintings as well as depictions of sieges of walled cities on precious metal and stone vessels and on seals of the early Mycenaean period illustrate scenes similar to those of the epics.⁵⁴ Some caution may be appropriate in this regard, however, for there would surely have been sieges of walled cities in many periods, and bards to sing of them. Some of the items of military equipment—the tower shield, helmets with horse-tail crest, long thrusting spears of approximately four meters in length, the boars' tusk helmet, and silver-studded swords—described in the epics seem especially to match depictions from early in the Palatial period.⁵⁵

- 48 A.B. HARRISON and N. SPENCER, "After the Palace: The Early 'History' of Messenia," in J.L. DAVIS (ed.), *Sandy Pylos* (1998) 149-150. A cogent and wide-ranging case for an increase in pastoralism in Greece in the Early Iron Age is set forth in A.M. SNODGRASS, *An Archaeology of Greece: The Present State and Future Scope of a Discipline* (1987) 190-209.
- 49 The Pylos archive contains one reference to gold as a raw material (PY Jo 438). K. VOUTSA, "Mycenaean Craftsmen in the Palace Archives: Problems in Interpretation," in A. MICHALIDOU (ed.), *Manufacture and Measurement: Counting, Measuring and Recording Craft Items in Early Aegean Societies* (2001) 155. T.G. PALAIMA notes that whatever the standard(s) employed by the palatial bureaucracies, a beef-eating elite warrior class could still have thought in terms of cattle value (personal communication).
- 50 See, e.g., re: hexameter, LATA CZ (*supra* n. 11) 261-263, 313-314 n. 17; T.G. PALAIMA, "Appendix One: Linear B Sources," in S.M. TRZASKOMA, R.S. SMITH and S. BRUNET (eds), *Anthology of Classical Myth* (2004) 442; RUIJGH (*supra* n. 26, 1985) 166; RUIJGH (*supra* n. 26, 1995) 91; G. NAGY, *The Best of the Achaeans: Concepts of the Hero in Archaic Greek Poetry* (1979) 187 n. 5; C. WATKINS, "Linguistic and Archaeological Light on Some Homeric Formulas," in S.N. SKOMAL and E.C. POLOMÉ (eds), *Proto-Indo-European: The Archaeology of a Linguistic Problem. Studies in Honor of Marija Gimbutas* (1987) 286-298; M.L. WEST, "The Rise of the Greek Epic," *JHS* 108 (1988) 151-156; E. COOK, personal communication of 21 October 2006; re: pre-Linear B word forms, SHERRATT (*supra* n. 31) 815; WATKINS (*supra*) 291; RUIJGH (*supra* n. 26, 1985) 146; RUIJGH (*supra* n. 26, 1995) 3-4; T.G. PALAIMA, personal communication of 17 August 2006.
- 51 P. WATHELET, "La coupe syllabique et les liquides voyelles dans la tradition formulaire de l'épopée grecque," in Y. LEBRUN (ed.), *Linguistic Research in Belgium* (1966) 145-173; RUIJGH (*supra* n. 26, 1985) 154-158; JANKO (*supra* n. 16) 9-12; LATA CZ (*supra* n. 11) 261.
- 52 J. CHADWICK, "The Descent of the Greek Epic," *JHS* 110 (1990) 174-177; contra Chadwick, see M.L. WEST, "The Descent of the Greek Epic: A Reply," *JHS* 112 (1992) 173-175. A. HEUBECK, S. WEST and J.B. HAINSWORTH, *A Commentary on Homer's Odyssey*, Vol. 1 (1988) 10; M.L. WEST, "Greek Poetry 2000-700 B.C.," *CQ* 67 (1973) 179-192; DICKINSON (*supra* n. 3) 21; KIRK (*supra* n. 28) 5-7. Skepticism about the Mycenaean origin of hexameter is expressed by R. Janko, following the work of N. Berg and D. Haug (D. HAUG and E. WELO, "The Proto-Hexameter Hypothesis: Perspectives for Further Research," *SymbOslo* 76 (2001) 130-136).
- 53 See *supra* n. 50 and R. JANKO, personal communication of 3 November 2006, for which I am most grateful.
- 54 S.P. MORRIS, "A Tale of Two Cities: The Miniature Frescoes from Thera and the Origins of Greek Poetry," *AJA* 93 (1989) 511-535. See also A. VLACHOPOULOS, this volume.
- 55 S.W. MANNING, "Archaeology and the World of Homer: Introduction to a Past and Present Discipline," in C. EMLYN-JONES, L. HARDWICK and J. PURKIS (eds), *Homer: Readings and Images* (1992) 122; re: boars'

The description in the *Iliad* of the tower shield of the Greater Ajax, the ruler of Salamis, appears in particular to match depictions from the Shaft Grave period, and some of the phrases used to describe Ajax are said to be notably “early” in linguistic terms.⁵⁶ The recent discovery by Y. Lolos of what appears to be a Mycenaean palace at Kanakia on Salamis, described below, has focused interest on the description of Ajax in the *Iliad*. On present evidence, there appears a discrepancy between the interpretation of the Homeric description of Ajax as belonging to a period prior to the Mycenaean palaces and the finds to date at the site of Kanakia, where the earliest material is IIIA2-IIIB transitional. Excavation is continuing and earlier material may still be found. The number of Bronze Age depictions of weapons is small in any event and hence its chronologically limited range may be fortuitous, while fixing Homeric phrases chronologically through linguistic analysis is subject to the various uncertainties described below. Linguistic aspects of descriptions apart, knowledge of the objects themselves could easily have come from later finds. Evidence of boars’ tusks was found in a Knossian Subminoan burial⁵⁷ and a boars’ tusk helmet was visible on a plaque on Delos in the 8th century.⁵⁸ Certain sanctuaries, such as Kato Syme⁵⁹ in Crete and Kalapodi in Phocis, appear to receive offerings without recognizable chronological interruption from the Bronze Age through the Iron Age, and around Knossos some reuse of Bronze Age tombs, larnakes and heirlooms is seen.⁶⁰ Certain Late Helladic IIC burials in particular are rich in *keimelia*, heirlooms from earlier periods, as are major Protogeometric burials such as that of Toumba at Lefkandi.

The sudden accession to great wealth indicated by the finds from the Shaft Graves has seemed to some the likely result of Mycenaean military prowess in this period.⁶¹ A vase of Mycenaean LH IIA (c. 1525-1450 B.C.) shape and decoration, but made of local (or at least Anatolian) clay was excavated at Troy, while a Hittite silver stag-shaped vessel was found in Shaft Grave IV at Mycenae.⁶² The great defensive wall of Troy VI is erected in this period.⁶³ By the reign of Tudhaliya II c. 1400 B.C., a man of Ahhiya(wa), Attarsiya, is reported to command an infantry detachment plus 100 chariots on the Anatolian coast.⁶⁴ (The identification of Ahhiyawa as a Mycenaean kingdom is discussed below.) A thrusting sword of Mycenaean type, dedicated by Tudhaliya to the Storm God as thanks for a victory, comes from the same horizon, as does

tusk helmet, cf. COOK (*supra* n. 23) 166 n. 124. See *Iliad* references to tower shields (*Il.* 6.117, 7.219), horse-tail crest helmets (*Il.* 3.336-337, 6.469-470, 6.494-495), long thrusting spears (*Il.* 6.318-319, 8.493-494, 19.387-388), boars’ tusk helmet (*Il.* 10.261-265) and silver-studded swords (e.g., *Il.* 3.334).

56 KIRK (*supra* n. 28) 208; WEST (*supra* n. 50) 158-159.

57 H.W. CATLING, “Tombs 200, 201, 202 SW,” “The Boar’s Tusk Fragments, 201.f13,” and “The Subminoan Phase in the North Cemetery at Knossos,” in J.N. COLDSTREAM and H.W. CATLING (eds), *Knossos North Cemetery. Early Greek Tombs (BSA, suppl. 28, 1996)* 191-195, 534-535, 647.

58 COOK (*supra* n. 46, forthcoming).

59 B.L. ERICKSON, “Aphraiti and Kato Syme: Pottery, Continuity, and Cult in Late Archaic and Classical Crete,” *Hesperia* 71 (2002) 44.

60 J.D. MUHLY, “Greece and Anatolia in the Early Iron Age: The Archaeological Evidence and the Literary Tradition,” in W.G. DEVER and S. GITIN (eds), *Symbiosis, Symbolism, and the Power of the Past: Canaan, Ancient Israel, and Their Neighbors from the Late Bronze Age through Roman Palestine. Proceedings of the Centennial Symposium, W.F. Albright Institute of Archaeological Research and American School of Oriental Research, Jerusalem, May 29-31, 2000* (2003) 28; W.-D. NIEMEIER, personal communication of 18 August 2006; J.N. COLDSTREAM, “Knossos in Early Greek Times,” in *Ancient Greece* (*supra* n. 33) 581-582.

61 G. KOPCKE, “Mycenaean Kingship—A Speculative View,” in R. ROLLINGER and C. ULF (eds), *Commerce and Monetary Systems in the Ancient World: Means of Transmission and Cultural Interaction* (2004) 170-180, connects the somewhat later rise of the Mycenaean palaces to wealth gained through conquest.

62 P.A. MOUNTJOY, *Mycenaean Pottery: An Introduction* (1993) 168; R.B. KOEHL, “The Silver Stag ‘Bibri’ from Mycenae,” in *Ages of Homer* 61-66.

63 I am grateful to E. Hayes for calling this to my attention. Of course both Mycenaean pottery and great defensive walls also occur later at Troy.

64 BRYCE (*supra* n. 43) 140-141. Bryce notes that previously this text had been thought to be much later, but that more recent scholarship in the evolution of Hittite grammar, orthography and *ductus* place the text in the middle Hittite period (414-415). A possible connection of Attarsiya to the Atreus of Greek legend was once suggested but subsequently abandoned by E. Forrer (D.L. PAGE, *History and the Homeric Iliad* [1959] 2, 23 n. 2, 98, 112 n. 3).

a Hittite bowl incised with a scene of a warrior wearing what may be Mycenaean dress.⁶⁵ LH IIIA2 (c. 1380-1310 B.C.)⁶⁶ is the great period of Mycenaean impact and expansion on the coast of Anatolia and in the Dodecanese.⁶⁷

The linguistic argument for pre-Linear B aspects of the poems requires convincing evidence, since it assumes the origins of phrases 700 or more years earlier, a period which includes the transition from pre-Mycenaean palace to palatial to dispersed post-palatial societies and the dislocation and movement of peoples, plus the acquisition and subsequent loss of bureaucratic literacy. Various hypotheses, not necessarily conflicting, may help to explain the existence and/or persistence of the ancient forms. First, the poet(s) of the epics may not have been troubled by the occasional necessity of altering word forms in contemporary use to fit the meter, since the result was to produce a *Kunstsprache* which created heroic distance. Isolated communities no doubt existed in which old forms persisted and could be deliberately imitated. Moreover, pre-Linear B usages could have been in use by much of the populace or in outlying areas concurrently with palatial Linear B, perhaps in Boeotia in particular. Older forms of speech may have persisted among the populations of East Locris, Phocis or Phthiotis, the homes of some of the major protagonists in the *Iliad*. Little is known directly about the Aeolic spoken in these areas before the 5th century B.C. and nothing about the Thessalian dialect spoken in Phthiotis. (Greek tradition remembers Pelasgians in particular as an ancient non-Greek-speaking people; it seems possible that they spoke an older form of Indo-European.) Accordingly it is appropriate to consider the possibility that pre-Linear B forms were in use, or had been more recently in use, in remote areas and accessible to later bards, and that bands of warriors such as those from Arcadia or Thessaly may have had their own bards.

Language isolates such as Basque are well known, and there are numerous others. In Malula in the barren Qalamun Mountains of Syria, the populace, both Muslim and Christian, speak not the Arabic that has been in use all around them for over 1000 years, but Aramaic, spoken in the Qalamun mountain villages for nearly 3000 years. The language continues to be spoken even though its written form has not survived.⁶⁸ There are villages in the Aspromonte Mountains of southern Italy where some do not speak Italian but only an archaic form of the Greek language, perhaps in continuous use since the colonization of Magna Graecia, but strengthened by new arrivals in the Byzantine era. One traveler reported that in all of Calabria in the late 13th century nothing but Greek was spoken.⁶⁹ Y. Sakellarakis reports that in the mountain villages near his excavations at Zominthos in Crete, where many of the inhabitants have never visited the coast, the shepherds sometimes exclaim "By Zas!", a term they cannot explain, let alone recognize as evolving from "By Zeus."⁷⁰

65 S.P. MORRIS, "Potnia Aswiya: Anatolian Contributions to Greek Religion," in R. LAFFINEUR and R. HÄGG (eds), *POTNIA: Deities and Religion in the Aegean Bronze Age. Proceedings of the 8th International Aegean Conference, Göteborg, Göteborg University, 12-15 April 2000, Aegeum 22* (2001) 426; K. BITTEL, "Tonschale mit Ritzzeichnung von Bogazköy," *RA* (1976) 9-14; A. ERTEKIN and I. EDIZ, "The Unique Sword from Bogazköy-Hattuša," in M.J. MELLINK, E. PORADA and T. ÖZGÜÇ (eds), *Aspects of Art and Iconography: Anatolia and Its Neighbors. Studies in Honor of Nimet Özgüç* (1993) 719-725; C. WATKINS, "Homer and Hittite Revisited: The Land of Aššuwā," in P. KNOX and C. FOSS (eds), *Style and Tradition: Studies in Honor of Wendell Clausen* (1998) 203; E. CLINE, "Aššuwā and the Achaeans: The 'Mycenaean' Sword at Hattušas and Its Possible Implications," *BSA* 91 (1996) 137-151. See also the reference at Pylos to the goddess Potnia as Aswiya (Assuwa) (MORRIS [*supra* n. 65] 423-434).

66 M.H. WIENER, "The Absolute Chronology of Late Helladic III A2 Revisited," *BSA* 98 (2003) 239-250.

67 C. MEE, "A Mycenaean Thalassocracy in the Eastern Aegean?" in E.B. FRENCH and K.A. WARDLE (eds), *Problems in Greek Prehistory. Papers Presented at the Centenary Conference of the British School of Archaeology at Athens, Manchester, April 1986* (1988) 301; M. GEORGIADIS, *The South-Eastern Aegean in the Mycenaean Period: Islands, Landscape, Death and Ancestors* (2003) 110-111. **BAR-IS 1196**,

68 D. JEHL, "Passing on History by Word of Mouth," *New York Times*, 4 September 1999, A4.

69 G. HULL, *Polyglot Italy: Languages, Dialects, Peoples* (1989). In parts of the Outer Banks, the islands off the coasts of North and South Carolina in the U.S., the thee/thou distinction is maintained today although generally abandoned over 300 years ago in England.

70 Y. SAKELLARAKIS, personal communication.

The position of Crete with respect to early linguistic forms merits separate attention. Homer speaks of the several languages and peoples of Crete,⁷¹ and indeed Crete would have been a likely area to retain old usages, for its Mycenaean population, arriving in force initially at the end of LM IB/beginning of LM II, may then have become isolated from mainland developments, while at the same time coming into regular contact with Minoan speakers. In the Praios region of eastern Crete, texts in Eteo-Cretan, a non-Greek language as yet undeciphered, were still being inscribed in the 4th-3rd century B.C. A number of the words in the epics which appear to reflect pre-Linear B Mycenaean forms occur in Homer's description of Crete and its chieftains, Idomeneus and Meriones. The formula in which Meriones is compared to the pre-Greek deity of war Eneualius, later syncretized with Ares, is regarded as one of the oldest in the *Iliad*.⁷² T.G. Palaima has raised the question of whether the hexameter of the poems is native to any form or dialect of Greek, or whether, together with much else in Mycenaean artistic and symbolic life, it was adopted from Minoan, along with the script and various words lacking known Indo-European roots.⁷³ Hexameter could conceivably have been adapted from Minoan verse at the same time as the Linear B script evolved out of Minoan Linear A (and/or Cretan hieroglyphic). We should note, however, Horrocks' argument that earlier forms of Indo-European are embedded in the epics. For example, Janko notes "that the 'tmesis' of those adverbs which were to become prepositions, a device basic to formulaic composition and modification and paralleled in Vedic, is outmoded in Mycenaean, where tmesis is rare; this implies that bards inherited from before that time one vital way in which the epic diction maintains its flexibility."⁷⁴ When a story celebrating an expedition against Troy was first sung in hexameter remains a critical unresolved question challenging linguistic analysis of the date of the origin of the Trojan War saga. It is accordingly important to distinguish between the use of older forms in phrases to fit the hexameter and the origins of the various tales themselves which are incorporated into the Homeric epics.

Of course a 16th-15th century B.C. horizon for the origin of the epics is inconsistent with later Greek traditions about the movements of peoples within Greece in the three generations following the Trojan War, including the arrival and subsequent history of the Dorians in the Peloponnese. Accordingly, acceptance on linguistic grounds of the proposition that the hexameter of the *Iliad* and *Odyssey* predates the Mycenaean Palatial period and the Greek of the Linear B tablets is often accompanied by the proposition that oral poets passed down through the generations various type scenes or story patterns composed in hexameter involving battles which were subsequently incorporated into an epic describing a siege of Troy.

III. A Trojan War in Late Helladic IIIB, c. 1300-1200 B.C. — New Perspectives on the Hittite Texts

We turn next to the case for placing the Trojan War or wars remembered in the *Iliad* (however vaguely or inaccurately) in the full Palatial period of LH IIIB. The argument has been strengthened significantly by recent discoveries and reevaluations. First, study of Hittite and Luwian texts and inscriptions, some in the form of rock carvings, by F. Starke, S. Heinhold-Krahmer and especially D. Hawkins has clarified the Late Bronze Age geography of western Anatolia. There now seems little doubt that the Wilusa of the Hittite texts is located in the northwest of Anatolia, and it further appears likely that its capital and major site was at Troy.

71 *Od.* 19.175.

72 WEST (*supra* n. 50) 156-159; REECE (*supra* n. 16) 43-89; RUIJGH (*supra* n. 26, 1985) 143-190.

73 RUIJGH (*supra* n. 26, 1985) 166; RUIJGH (*supra* n. 26, 1995) 91; A. MEILLET, *Les origines indo-européennes des mètres grecs* (1923) 31-42; T.G. PALAIMA, personal communication.

74 E. Hallager has proposed that the Linear B script evolved out of Cretan hieroglyphic rather than out of Linear A (E. HALLAGER, "On the Origin of Linear B Administration," in *10th International Cretological Congress, Xania, 1-8 October 2006, Abstracts* [2006] 72); see also G.C. HORROCKS, "The Antiquity of the Greek Epic Tradition: Some New Evidence," *PCPS* 26 (1980) 1-11; JANKO (*supra* n. 16) 11; S.W. JAMISON, "Draupadi on the Walls of Troy: *Iliad* 3 from an Indic Perspective," *ClAnt* 13 (1994) 5-16.

Accordingly, the possible derivation Wilusa/Wilios, and later Ilion, gains in plausibility, although still conjectural.⁷⁵ It is even more likely that the Lazpa, Apasa and Millawanda/Milawata known to the Hittites are the Greek Lesbos, Ephesus and Miletus.⁷⁶

The Hittite texts speak of a land of Ahhiyawa and its ruler, in one instance described as a great king, whose location/capital is not stated but who controls a territory on the Anatolian coast and adjacent islands. On the basis of recent excavations of Mycenaean LH IIIA2-IIIB material, such a zone seems to extend from Miletus to Bodrum and from Samos to Rhodes. At Miletus, the excavations of Wolf and Barbara Niemeier have disclosed a major Mycenaean settlement succeeding an earlier Minoan site, which continues under Mycenaean occupation and control until the middle of the 13th century B.C., when it appears to come briefly under the control of the Hittites, before reverting perhaps to the Mycenaean sphere.⁷⁷ An alternative interpretation of the archaeological evidence, set forth in detail by P.A. Mountjoy, S. Sherratt, and others, would ascribe the Mycenaean characteristics in this area to acculturation of a local population or to a mixed population with a major native Anatolian component. This interpretation, however, does not appear to give adequate weight to the overwhelmingly Mycenaean character of Miletus at least,⁷⁸ and of the tomb types and their contents at Müsgebi. Just as a local population may acquire a Mycenaean lifestyle, so may Mycenaean Greeks acquire certain aspects of the style of what Mountjoy has termed the Anatolian interface, with intermarriage often a key element in such exchanges. More Late Bronze Age coastal sites may await discovery beneath the later classical sites, for in general the water table intrudes in the Geometric period, with alluvial fill beneath.⁷⁹ Changes in the shoreline such as those documented at Liman Tepe may also have led to the disappearance of coastal sites.⁸⁰

No major palatial structure or administrative center has been discovered to date in this area, however, leading most scholars (including the author) to believe that in the 13th century B.C., the state of Ahhiyawa included and was usually under the control of a power whose center lay in mainland Greece. Hawkins summarizes the position as follows:

The web of interlocking locations arising from . . . the recognition of the Karabel inscription as the work of a king of Mira . . . cannot but bear on the vexed question of the land of Ahhiyawa. Now it may be argued more strongly than ever both that there remains no place for this country on the Anatolian mainland, and that Ahhiyawa lying 'across the sea' impinges mainly on the Anatolian west coast, above all at Millawanda-Miletos. This therefore remits the problem of the character and extent of the land of Ahhiyawa under its sometime Great King to the field of Aegean or perhaps mainland Greek archaeology.⁸¹

-
- 75 T.G. PALAIMA, "Ilios, Tros and Tlos: Continuing Problems with *to-ro*, *to-ro-o*, *to-ro-wo*, *to-ro-ja*, *wi-ro* and *a-si-wi-ja/a-si-wi-jo*," (forthcoming). For a skeptical view, see I. HAJNAL, *Troia aus sprachwissenschaftlicher Sicht: Die Struktur einer Argumentation* (2003).
- 76 F. STARKE, "Troia im Kontext des historisch-politischen und sprachlichen Umfeldes Kleinasiens im 2. Jahrtausend," *Studia Troica* 7 (1997) 447-487; S. HEINHOLD-KRAHMER, *Arzawa. Untersuchungen zu seiner Geschichte nach den hethitischen Quellen* (1977) 351; J.D. HAWKINS, "Tarkasnawa King of Mira 'Tarkondemos': Bogazköy Sealings and Karabel," *AnatSt* 48 (1998) 1-31.
- 77 W.-D. NIEMEIER, "Greek Territories and the Hittite Empire: Mycenaean and Hittites in West Asia Minor," in N.C. STAMPOLIDIS and V. KARAGEORGHIS (eds), *Ploes . . . Sea Routes . . . from Sidon to Huelva. Interconnections in the Mediterranean, 16th-6th c. B.C.* (2003) 106.
- 78 P.A. MOUNTJOY, "The East Aegean-West Anatolian Interface in the Late Bronze Age: Mycenaean and the Kingdom of Ahhiyawa," *AnatSt* 48 (1998) 37; E.S. SHERRATT, "Potemkin Palaces and Route-based Economies," in S. VOUTSAKI and J. KILLEN (eds), *Economy and Politics in the Mycenaean Palace States. Proceedings of a Conference held on 1-3 July 1999 in the Faculty of Classics, Cambridge* (2001) 214-238.
- 79 W.-D. NIEMEIER, personal communication. Only the creative employment of oil dredging equipment to remove water permitted the excavation of Bronze Age strata at Miletus.
- 80 [H. ERKANAL], *Archaeological Researches at Liman Tepe* (n.d.) 3; J.C. KRAFT, G. RAPP, İ. KAYAN and J. LUCE, "Harbor Areas at Ancient Troy: Sedimentology and Geomorphology Complement Homer's Iliad," *Geology* 31 (2003) 163-166.
- 81 J.D. HAWKINS, "Hittites on the Aegean Coast: New Evidence," *BICS* 42 (1997-1998) 232.

Here again, an example may illuminate the question. A Hittite text states that a high-ranking Hittite official related by marriage to the royal family, has shared a chariot with Tawagalawa, the brother of the king of Ahhiyawa.⁸² One Hittite text speaks of a man from Ahhiyawa leading a contingent of 100 chariots. The knowledge (acquired initially from the Near Eastern, Egyptian and/or Minoan realms), craft skills and expense involved in creating even a single chariot is significant.⁸³ There is no evidence of such capability in Rhodes or on the Anatolian Coast, whereas the Linear B tablets speak of eighty chariots at Knossos (KN Sf[2] 4420) and fifty axles at Pylos (PY Vn 10).⁸⁴ Wall-painting fragments from the LH IIIB destruction debris of the megaron at Mycenae and Pylos show scenes of chariots, horses and battles, and at Mycenae, include what appears to be a depiction of a besieged city. Similar battle scenes appear in wall-painting fragments from Orchomenos.⁸⁵ At Pylos, the depictions include ships.⁸⁶

Other recent research has also strengthened the case for significant contacts between Mycenaean Greece of the Palatial period and the Hittite Anatolian realm including the Hittite vassal state with its capital at Wilusa in the Troad. At Troy in particular significant amounts of LH IIIA2 and IIIB pottery have been found, both imported and locally made.⁸⁷ Locally-made versions of LH IIIA2 and IIIB pottery, perhaps made by itinerant Mycenaean potters, and pottery of Trojan type, sometimes of clay chemically identified as coming from the Troad, appear at many coastal sites including Miletus.⁸⁸

The nature of the interaction appears to extend beyond trade contact and stylistic emulation to the realm of burial practice and rites. The cemetery of Beşik Tepe on the coast near Troy, with pottery of LH IIIA and B, contains a mixture of inhumations and cremations in kraters accompanied by weapons. A few of the burials were covered by two stone-built structures. Mycenaean and Mycenaean-influenced pottery makes up nearly one-third of all fine wares from the site.⁸⁹ Similar funerary arrangements exist at Bakla Tepe and Panaztepe, again with stone-built burial structures. All of the sites show evidence of rites continuing at the structures after the initial burials. M. Basedow holds that "what these coastal cemeteries have in common with the long Mycenaean tradition—collective burial, weapons in graves, rites continued after initial burial, elite graves—is, however, striking,"⁹⁰ adding that "the expression of elite status in the West Anatolian coastal cemeteries, particularly the breaking of distinctly Mycenaean kylikes and the overwhelming amounts of Mycenaean pottery found in graves as opposed to settlements, may represent a very direct case of emulation indeed."⁹¹

Fragments of wall paintings of Mycenaean technique have been discovered in Büyükkale at Hattusa.⁹² A cogent case has been made for significant Hittite influence on Mycenaean building techniques, hydraulic systems and citadel construction, for example in the corbeled passageways and postern gate at Tiryns.⁹³ Moreover, a generation of scholarship has explored

82 R. HOPE SIMPSON, "The Dodecanese and the Ahhiyawa Question," *BSA* 98 (2003) 230; O.T.P.K. DICKINSON, "Ahhiyawan Questions" (forthcoming). I am greatly indebted to O. Dickinson for sharing papers in press with me.

83 Simply the care and feeding of horses involves considerable expense.

84 VOÜTSA (*supra* n. 49) 152.

85 *Aegean Painting* 123-125.

86 J. DAVIS, personal communication, for which I am most grateful.

87 MOUNTJOY (*supra* n. 78) 37.

88 H. MOMMSEN, D. HERTEL and P.A. MOUNTJOY, "Neutron Activation Analysis of the Pottery from Troy in the Berlin Schliemann Collection," *AA* (2001) 169-211; MOUNTJOY (*supra* n. 44, 1997) 259-267; MOUNTJOY (*supra* n. 62) 172, 174.

89 M. BASEDOW, "Cemetery and Ideology in the West Anatolian Coastal Region," in *Mauerschau* 469.

90 BASEDOW (*supra* n. 89) 472.

91 BASEDOW (*supra* n. 89) 472-473.

92 W.-D. NIEMEIER, "Millawanda/Miletus—Ahhiyawan Foothold in Western Asia Minor," paper presented at the Workshop *Mycenaean and Anatolians in the Late Bronze Age: The Ahhiyawa Question*, Concordia University, Montreal, 4-5 January 2006.

93 P. NEVE, "Eine hethitische Bronzesäule," *IstMitt* 39 (1989) 405; "Hethitische Gewölbebau," in A. HOFFMAN (ed.), *Bautechnik der Antike (Deutsches archäologisches Institut: Diskussion zur archäologischen Bauforschung* 5, 1991) 164; W.-D. NIEMEIER, "The Mycenaean in Western Anatolia and the Problem of the Origins of the Sea Peoples," in S. GITIN, A. MAZAR and E. STERN (eds), *Mediterranean Peoples in Transition: Thirteenth to Early Tenth Centuries BCE. In Honor of Professor Trude Dothan* (1998) 43. E.g., J. WRIGHT, "Hittite Influences

and established the debt of Greek religion, myth and aspects of prosody, such as framing formulae, to Hittite-Hurrian, Sumero-Akkadian and Ugaritic narrative poetry.⁹⁴ One example may suffice: at Hittite Zalpa, a foundation legend referred to the marriage of thirty brothers to their thirty sisters, while a myth that may have a Bronze Age origin regarding the establishment of the Danaoi in the Argolid recounts the marriage of fifty daughters of Danaos to the fifty sons of his twin, Aegyptos.⁹⁵ At least some of the Eastern influence seems to reflect contacts during the Bronze Age.⁹⁶

At least twenty Hittite texts from Hattusa refer to correspondence with rulers of Ahhiyawa.⁹⁷ One Hittite text advises seeking aid from the gods of Lazpa (Lesbos) and Ahhiyawa for the Hittite ruler Mursili II (c. 1321-1295), who has lost the power of speech.⁹⁸ The list of Greek borrowings, or loan words (e.g., “depas”), from Hittite/Luwian continues to expand.⁹⁹ One case of reverse borrowing may exist, for the name of the Wilusan ruler Alaksandu appears to have a non-Luwian origin, and the temptation to connect the name to the Alexandros of the *Iliad* is difficult to resist. We know of Alaksandu from the text of a treaty between Wilusa and the Hittite ruler Muwatalli II, who ruled c. 1295-1272 B.C. (Alaksandu could of course have outlived Muwatalli II.)¹⁰⁰

-
- in Mycenaean Architecture: Half-timbering,” paper presented at *TEXNH*; J. MARAN, “Architektonische Innovation im spätmykenischen Tiryns—Lokale Bauprogramme und fremde Kultureinflüsse,” in *Althellenische Technologie und Technik: von der prähistorischen bis zur hellenistischen Zeit mit Schwerpunkt auf der prähistorischen Epoche. 4. Internationale Tagung, 21-23.03.2003 in Ohlstadt/Obb. Deutschland* (2004) 261-286; C. MAGGIDIS, “Mycenae Abroad: Mycenaean Foreign Policy, the Anatolian Frontier, and the Theory of Overextension—Reconstructing an Integrated Causal Nexus for the Decline and Fall of the Mycenaean World,” paper presented at the *Conference Foreign Relations and Diplomacy in the Ancient World: Egypt, Greece, Near East, University of the Aegean, Rhodes, Greece, 3-5 December 2004*; U. THALER, “Ahhiyawa and Hatti: Palatial Perspectives,” in S. ANTONIADOU and A. PACE (eds), *Mediterranean Crossroads* (forthcoming). More skeptical, but offering partial support regarding the identity of citadel plans, is M. KÜPPER, *Mykenische Architektur: Material, Bearbeitungstechnik, Konstruktion und Erscheinungsbild* (1996) 119; NIEMEIER (*supra* n. 92). See also the recent discovery by A. Çınaroğlu of a Hittite dam at Alacahöyük (“Ancient Hittite Dam Inaugurated after 32 Centuries,” *Turkish Daily News*, 20 September 2006).
- 94 WEST (*supra* n. 50) 169, and sources cited, particularly L.A. STELLA, *Il poema d’Ulisse* (1955) 107-123, 134-147, 157-168; L.A. STELLA, *Tradizione micenea e poesia dell’Iliade* (1978) 88, 362-368, 374-391; T.B.L. WEBSTER, *From Mycenae to Homer* (1958) 69-76; and W. BURKERT, *Die orientalisierende Epoche in der griechischen Religion und Literatur* (1984) 106-110.
- 95 W. BURKERT, “Typen griechischer Mythen auf dem Hintergrund mykenischer und orientalischer Tradition,” in D. MUSTI (ed.), *La Transizione dal Miceneo all’Alto Archaismo. Dal palazzo alla città. Atti del Convegno Internazionale, Roma, 14-19 marzo 1988* (1991) 534.
- 96 WEST (*supra* n. 50) 169. Post-Bronze Age contacts with the East, perhaps particularly via Euboean voyagers and various contacts with Phoenicians, no doubt added significantly to knowledge of Near Eastern narratives. Aphrodite and Apollo, who appear in Homer but not among the deities mentioned in the Linear B tablets, may be Early Iron Age imports from the East.
- 97 T. BRYCE, “Ahhiyawans and Mycenaean—An Anatolian Viewpoint,” *OJA* 8 (1989) 297-310; BRYCE (*supra* n. 43) 59-63, 321-324, 342-344. Whether Ahhiyawa is a Hittite rendering of Achaea has been long disputed (F. SOMMER, *Die Ahhijawa-Urkunden* [1932]; *Ahhijawafrage und Sprachwissenschaft* [1934]; H. BENGTSON, review of A. ERZEN, *Kilikien bis zum Ende der Perserherrschaft*, in *Gnomon* 18 [1942] 209-211; G. STEINER, “Die Ahhijawa-Frage heute,” *Saeculum* 15 [1964] 365-392; F. SCHACHERMEYER, *Hethiter und Achäer* [1935]; *Mykene und das Hethiterreich* [1986]; PAGE [*supra* n. 64] 1-40; G.I. HUXLEY, *Achaeans and Hittites* [1965]; H.G. GÜTERBOCK, “Hittites and Achaeans: A New Look,” *PAPS* 128 [1984] 114-122; “Troy in the Hittite Texts? Wilusa, Ahhiyawa, and Hittite History,” in M.J. MELLINK (ed.), *Troy and the Trojan War, a Symposium held at Bryn Mawr College, 19 October 1984* [1986] 33-44; W. HELCK, “Zur Kestiu-, Alasia-, und Ahhijawa-Frage,” *Ägäische Bronzezeit* [1987] 218-226; J.G. MACQUEEN, *The Hittites and Their Contemporaries in Asia Minor* [1986] 39-41; J. MELLAART, “Hatti, Arzawa and Ahhiyawa: A Review of the Present Stalemate in Historical and Geographical Studies,” in G.E. MYLONAS (ed.), *Philia Epi eis Georgion E. Mylonas, A’* [1986] 74-84; J.D. MUHLY, “Hittites and Achaeans: Ahhiyawa Redomitus,” *Historia* 23 [1974] 129-145; SHERRATT [*supra* n. 78] 217-218 n. 9; MANNING [*supra* n. 55] 137-138).
- 98 MORRIS (*supra* n. 65) 428.
- 99 Cf. H. VON KAMPTZ, *Homeric Personennamen: sprachwissenschaftliche und historische Klassifikation* (1956) 380-388, with LATACZ (*supra* n. 11) 117.
- 100 A similar etymological connection appears to exist between the Tawagalawa of the famous letter discussed below and the Greek Eteoklewes (later Eteokles), with the initial Luwian consonant dropped in the Greek version (H.G. GÜTERBOCK, “Wer war Tawagalawa?” *Orientalia* 59 [1990] 158; cited with approval in LATACZ [*supra* n. 11] 117). While D.L. Page was skeptical, calling the equation of Tawagalawa with

Most significant for Trojan War scholarship, however, are the texts referring to strife, including one which refers to a dispute between the Hittites and Ahhiyawa over islands lying off Wilusa. In the Tawagalawa letter (most of which is missing) the Hittite ruler Hattusili III, c. 1267-1237 B.C., complains to the ruler of Ahhiyawa (whom he addresses as "my brother") that one Piyamaradu is ravaging the lands of Hatti's vassals and escaping across the sea to Ahhiyawa. After attacking Wilusa and Lazpa and taking captives, Piyamaradu settled at Millawanda, then under the control of Ahhiyawa, according to the complaint of the Hittite ruler.¹⁰¹ Places with names similar to names of sites along the Anatolian coast, including particularly Millawanda, also appear in the Pylos tablets in the descriptions of craftspeople, mostly women, some of them slaves.¹⁰² Most importantly, the Tawagalawa letter refers specifically to a raid on Wilusa from Ahhiyawa-controlled territory and concludes that it would not be good to have a war over these disputes.

A recent discovery adds significant new information. In 2003, Professor Frank Starke of Tübingen presented a revised reading of a long-known text from Hattusa (*KUB XXVI.91*), interpreting it as a letter from the ruler of Ahhiyawa.¹⁰³ Paleographic evidence indicates that the letter or record of a letter was written in the 13th century B.C. and further evidence suggests that the message was received by the sender of the Tawagalawa letter, Hattusili III (c. 1267-1237 B.C.).¹⁰⁴ The communication deals with a dispute over islands off the coast of Wilusa, perhaps including Lemnos, Imbros and/or Samothrace. With respect to Lemnos in particular, Hiller has noted the ties between the Lemnian and Pylian royal houses in historical genealogy, the fact that the name of the Homeric Lemnian king *e-u-na-wo* (Eunawos) is found in Knossos Linear B tablets As 1520, B 799 and Dv 206, and the appearance of "Lemnian" slave women in the Pylos tablets.¹⁰⁵ The *Iliad* speaks of the Greek army gathered at Troy receiving gifts of wine from Lemnos.¹⁰⁶

Whether the island of Lesbos is also a candidate merits separate consideration. On the one hand, the texts cited indicate that Lazpa was clearly a part of the Hittite Empire when the letters were written. In the *Iliad*, Achilles refers to Lesbos as the farthest outpost of Priam's

Erewoklewēs an improbable guess (PAGE [*supra* n. 64] 23), both R. Janko (personal communication of 6 November 2006) and C. Melchert (personal communication of 30 January 2007) accept the equation. Janko notes that "Tawagalawa was the brother of the king of Ahhiyawa, so he should have an Achaean name. The name Eteokles goes back to Etewoklewes, i.e. 'True Glory' in Greek and the same name as Tawagalawa, with misdivision causing the loss of the initial E- and subsequent loss of the digammas in later Greek" (personal communication of 6 November 2006).

101 Of course the Millawanda/Milawata of the tablets may refer to the site of Miletus in Crete or some other Milawata.

3/ 102 PALAIMA (*supra* n. 17). Whether Troia appears in the Linear B tablets in designation of workers has been a subject of much debate, with C. Melchert and T.G. Palaima firmly in opposition to the proposed identification. PALAIMA (*supra* n. 75); PALAIMA (*supra* n. 17). The claim that a reference to Troia also appears at Thebes has met with a mixed reception. Pro: LATACZ (*supra* n. 11) 280-281; V. ARAVANTINOS, L. GODART and A. SACCONI, *Thèbes: Fouilles de la Cadmée I* (2001) 356; "Sui nuovi testi del palazzo di Cadmo a Tebe," *Atti della Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei: Rendiconti* 6 (1995) 1-37; L. GODART and A. SACCONI, "La géographie des états mycéniens," *CRAI* April-June (1999) 527-546; V. PARKER, "Die Aktivitäten der Mykenäer in der Ost-Ägäis im Lichte der Linear B-Tafeln," in *Florent Studia Mycenaea. Akten des X. Internationalen Mykenologischen Colloquiums in Salzburg vom 1.-5. Mai 1995* (1999) 495-502. Contra: T.G. Palaima, personal communication of 7 August 2006; F. AURA JORRO, *Diccionario micénico* (1985-1993); J. CHADWICK, *Documents in Mycenaean Greek* (1973²); M. LEJEUNE, *Mémoires de philologie mycénienne* (1958) 133 n. 21.

103 F. STARKE, Troy press conferences held 9 and 11 August 2003. The text could also constitute a record of an oral presentation by a messenger or ambassador of Ahhiyawa.

104 LATACZ (*supra* n. 11) 243. The assertion by F. Starke and J. Latacz that linguistic features of the text indicate that the sender spoke Mycenaean Greek rather than Hittite as his mother tongue has been firmly rejected by C. Melchert and others (STARKE [*supra* n. 103]; LATACZ [*supra* n. 11] 243; C. MELCHERT, "Mycenaean and Hittite Diplomatic Correspondence: Fact and Fiction," paper presented at the Workshop *Mycenaeans and Anatolians in the Late Bronze Age: The Ahhiyawa Question*, Concordia University, Montreal, 4-5 January 2006). Luwian, a variant of Hittite, would presumably have been the language of non-Greeks living alongside Ahhiyawan Mycenaean in the Anatolian interface, where bilingualism would naturally arise through interbreeding.

105 S. HILLER, "R1-AI-NI-A: Mykenische-kleinasiatische Beziehungen und die Linear B-Texte," *Ziva Ant* 25 (1975) 400-401, 403 and n. 96. See the discussion in PALAIMA (*supra* n. 75).

106 *Il.* 7.467.

kingdom. N. Spencer summarizes the results of his archaeological explorations of Lesbos as indicating that Lesbos was “very much an extension of the Anatolian cultural tradition both before, and even after, the arrival of the Aeolian Greeks.”¹⁰⁷ On the other hand, R. Janko reports that “in the Museum at Mytilene I saw good Anatolian wares from the east coast (Thermi), but good LH IIIB from the Gulf of Kallone; the Anatolian disappears in LH IIIC, whereas Apotheka is an entirely Helladic settlement, with LH IIIC tombs (pers. comm., Ephor of Lesbos). The conquest of Lesbos by the Greeks was, I suspect, the most lasting result of the Trojan War”¹⁰⁸ (but *cf.* below).

The ruler of Ahhiyawa refers to a prior letter in which the Hittite king had claimed the islands as his and rejects the Hittite claim on the grounds that an ancestor of the king of Ahhiyawa received the islands from the king of Assuwa, a predecessor state (prior to the end of the 15th century B.C.) to Wilusa and other states along the Anatolian coast. Latacz’s interpretation of the text as referring to a dynastic marriage between the royal families of Assuwa and Ahhiyawa has been accepted by C. Melchert.¹⁰⁹ One aspect of this message from the ruler of Ahhiyawa has aroused great controversy. The ruler names his 15th century B.C. (or earlier) ancestor, one Kaganuna. Starke, seconded by Latacz, believes that the name represents a Hittite rendering of Kadmos, and this view has been adopted by L. Godart and A. Sacconi.¹¹⁰ The suggestion has been dismissed as impossible, however, by most specialists in the Hittite, Luwian and/or Greek languages.¹¹¹ (With regard to this and similar questions of etymology, it is appropriate to recall the admonition of Socrates in Plato’s *Cratylus*: “If you are permitted to put in and pull out any letters you please, names are easily made, and any name may be adapted to any object.”¹¹²) Moreover, Melchert notes that the structure of the text suggests that Kaganuna is more likely to have been a forebear of the king of Assuwa than the king of Ahhiyawa.¹¹³

One further Hittite text merits mention in connection with the chronology of a putative Mycenaean expedition against Troy. A draft of a treaty between Tudhaliya IV (c. 1237-1228 B.C.) and his vassal, the king of Amurru (in what is now Lebanon and Syria), bans traffic between Ahhiyawa and Assyria, with which Hatti was then at war, through the ports of Amurru.¹¹⁴ Mycenaean exports to the East do in fact drop markedly after this point, if the paucity of imported LH IIIB2 pottery is any indication. In the treaty draft, Tudhaliya IV lists the kings equal to him in rank, the rulers of Egypt, Kassite Babylonia, Assyria and Ahhiyawa, but Ahhiyawa is crossed out. (It should be noted that the draft text has many changes and corrections; accordingly, it would be unsafe to assume that a dramatic event had occurred between drafts of the treaty. Of course the corrected reference could even have resulted from a scribal error, but in that case it is relevant that the scribe at least thought the reference plausible.) In any event, references elsewhere to the king of Ahhiyawa as “brother” suggest that the ruler of Ahhiyawa controlled a polity significant to the Hittites at the time these texts were composed. O. Dickinson observes that Egyptian pharaohs addressed rulers of far smaller states as “brother” when the pharaoh wanted something.¹¹⁵

Hittites and Assyrians were at war, but the text of the Amurru treaty draft as it survives bans Assyrian traffic only with Ahhiyawa. Was this because Ahhiyawa was a potential source of swords, shields or mercenaries for Assyria, or because the Hittites were retaliating for an

107 N. SPENCER, “Early Lesbos Between East and West: A ‘Grey Area’ of Aegean Archaeology,” *BSA* 90 (1995) 272. Lesbos lies only 18 km. off the coast of Anatolia. Alkaios and Sappho both mention Lydians as dabbling in the factional fighting at Lesbos in their day.

108 R. JANKO, personal communication of 6 November 2006.

109 LATACZ (*supra* n. 11) 244; MELCHERT (*supra* n. 104).

110 STARKE (*supra* n. 103); LATACZ (*supra* n. 11) 243-244; GODART and SACCONI (*supra* n. 102) 545.

111 See, e.g., papers and comments by PALAIMA (*supra* n. 11); MELCHERT (*supra* n. 104).

112 Plato, *Crat.* 414d.

113 MELCHERT (*supra* n. 104). R. JANKO observes that if Kaganuna is to be equated with a Greek name, a better equation, if still highly conjectural, is Agamemnon (!), adding that “for the disturbance to the initial syllable in the Anatolian transcription compare Tawagalawa/Etewoklewas” (personal communication of 6 November 2006). C. Melchert, however, regards this suggestion as even less plausible than the Kadmos proposal (personal communication of 30 January 2007).

114 BRYCE (*supra* n. 43) 343-344.

115 DICKINSON (*supra* n. 82).

Ahhiyawan attack or attacks on Hittite vassals along the coast including Wilusa, or for some other reason? The cause of the deletion of the king of Ahhiyawa from the list of great kings is similarly a matter of conjecture. Millawanda, and perhaps all other Anatolian coastal cities as well, are captured by the Hittites by the mid-13th century B.C.¹¹⁶ Alternatively or perhaps relatedly, grave problems in the Ahhiyawan homeland may have led to the deletion. At the end of LH IIIB1, around 1240 B.C., the Argolid suffers a great earthquake. At Mycenae, every building, both inside and outside the citadel, is destroyed, although most are rebuilt. At the major Mycenaean citadels, walls are extended and water supplies are secured.¹¹⁷ In Crete, coastal sites begin to be abandoned in favor of inland defensive settlements. On this line of argument, a date before c. 1240 B.C. rather than later may seem more appropriate to a massive military expedition, or at least one based on might rather than need (for example, need for grain).

It is important to note, however, that the Linear B tablets from the destruction of Pylos a short time later show that the palace in the final days was able to command significant military resources, including ships for at least 600 rowers, some summoned from Zakynthos, at least twelve shipwrights and probably more, unless those mentioned in three other tablets overlap the twelve mentioned on PY Vn 865. Pylos employed 500-600 women workers in the clothing industry, many of them probably foreign captives.¹¹⁸ Tablets originally appear to have listed around 400 bronzesmiths (the broken surviving portions list 270) distributed over many locations, but only a small amount of copper is assigned to each bronzesmith, raising the possibility of a copper shortage at that moment.¹¹⁹ The Point Iria shipwreck at the end of LH IIIB shows that exchange links still existed between Cyprus and the Argolid around 1200 B.C.¹²⁰

Midea, the third Mycenaean citadel in the Argolid and rich in legend, remains to be considered. The excavators concluded that the citadel was destroyed in the final phase of LH IIIB2 by a major earthquake. IIIC occupation is attested; on the Lower Terrace a Post-palatial structure is built over a large IIIB structure which included a megaron, and a painted plaster floor was found with IIIC pottery. A few IIIC Granary Style sherds were reported from the earlier excavations by A. Persson.¹²¹ Further, a few scattered examples of Protogeometric and Geometric pottery have been found in the current excavations of G. Walberg, but the next significant phase of occupation comes in the Archaic period.¹²² Homer, however, never refers to Midea, notwithstanding its central role in the labors of Heracles. Moreover, the Mycenaean foundation myth speaks of Perseus, the founder of the first ruling dynasty, as the builder of the walls of Mycenae, Tiryns and Midea. Homer displays familiarity with myths about Mycenae mainly to the extent that they involve Thebes, and says nothing of the return of the Heraclidae

116 NIEMEIER (*supra* n. 77) 107.

117 C. MAGGIDIS, "Mycenae in Depth: Recent Excavations and Systematic Geoprospection Survey in the Citadel and Lower City—Preliminary Results and Prospects," paper presented at the *New York Aegean Bronze Age Colloquium, Institute of Fine Arts, New York, 7 April 2006*.

118 For rowers, see T.G. PALAIMA, "Maritime Matters in the Linear B Tablets," in R. LAFFINEUR (ed.), *THALASSA: L'Égée préhistorique et la mer. Actes de la troisième Rencontre égéenne internationale de Université de Liège, Station de recherches sous-marines et océanographiques (StaReSO), Calvi, Corse (23-25 avril 1990), Aegaeum 7 (1991) 285*; J.T. KILLEN, "Conscription and Corvée at Mycenaean Pylos," in M. PERNA (ed.), *Fiscalità in Mycenaean and Near Eastern Archives. Proceedings of the Conference Held at Soprintendenza Archivistica per la Campania, Naples, 21-23 October 2004 (2006) 75. For female weavers, cf. Penelope working alone at her loom in the Odyssey*. COOK, review of SHEAR (*supra* n. 3) 666. *Studi Egizi e Vicinorientali 3*,

119 KILLEN (*supra* n. 118) 77; PALAIMA (*supra* n. 118) 288, 308-309; J. CHADWICK, *The Mycenaean World (1976) 140-141, 173*.

120 W. PHELPS, Y. LOLOS, and Y. VICHOS (eds), *The Point Iria Wreck: Interconnections in the Mediterranean ca. 1200 B.C. Proceedings of the International Conference, Island of Spetses, 19 September 1998 (1999)*.

121 G. WALBERG quoted in D. BLACKMAN, "Midea," *AR 43 (1997) 28-29*; G. WALBERG, "I. The Site," in *Excavations on the Acropolis of Midea: Results of the Greek-Swedish Excavations under the Direction of Katie Demakopoulou and Paul Åström, Vol. 1:1, The Excavations on the Lower Terraces 1985-1991 (1998) 17*; K. DEMAKOPOULOU, "The Pottery from the Destruction Layers in Midea: Late Helladic IIIB2 Late or Transitional Late Helladic IIIB2/Late Helladic IIIC Early?" in S. DEGER-JALKOTZY and M. ZAVADIL (eds), *LH III C: Chronology and Synchronisms. Proceedings of the International Workshop Held at the Austrian Academy of Sciences at Vienna, May 7th and 8th, 2001 (2003) 90-91*.

122 WALBERG (*supra* n. 121) 17.

and the Dorians, although his reference in the Catalogue of Ships to Dorian Argos and Sparta as the major centers of the Argolid, appropriate to Archaic rather than Mycenaean Greece,¹²³ may reflect the desire of the Dorians to be included and/or the desire of the author to create a Panhellenic epic.¹²⁴ Of course Thucydides as well as various legends place the arrival of the Dorians in the Peloponnese after the Trojan War, as noted above. Succeeding passages in the *Iliad* present conflicting accounts of political organization. In Book 2 of the *Iliad* Agamemnon is described as ruler of all Argos and many islands;¹²⁵ but later in Book 2 Diomedes is said to rule Argos and Tiryns of the huge walls, along with other sites in the Argolid.¹²⁶ A Trojan war around either the end of IIB or during the IIC Middle revival could perhaps fit the tradition, recorded and accepted by Thucydides, that eighty years separated the Trojan War from the return of the Heraclidae and the descent of the Dorians, if the period between about 1120 and 1070 B.C. is regarded as a time of disruption in certain areas, which may be connected in some degree to the descent.¹²⁷

IV. The End of the Palatial Period

At the end of LH IIB/beginning of IIC, the Mycenaean palatial system comes to a fairly abrupt end, bringing with it the loss of palatial bureaucratic literacy. In the Argolid at least, another major earthquake can be identified. Destructions in Boeotia included Thebes, Orchomenos, and the massive citadel of the Kopais basin at Gla. The great drainage system of the Kopais, on which a vast amount of labor was expended,¹²⁸ was also destroyed, perhaps causing food shortages. Further north the site of Dimini near Volos, the ancient Iolkos, where recent excavations have revealed a large Mycenaean settlement, is abandoned together with its harbor at Pefkasia Magoula on the Gulf of Pagasae.¹²⁹ In Messenia, the palace of Pylos is destroyed, and the depopulation of much of Messenia and Laconia quickly follows. A chronological progression of destruction from north to south has been suggested on the basis

123 Homer does, however, recount stories of Diomedes and Tydeus and mentions that Mycenae, Sparta and Argos share Hera as their particular divinity (W. BURKERT, *Kleine Schriften I: Homerica* [2001] 172-173). In *Iliad* 23.471, Idomeneus refers to Diomedes as Aetolian, but ruling among the Argives. B. EDER ("The World of Telemachus: Western Greece 1200-700 BC," in *Ancient Greece* [supra n. 33] 560) has concluded that the Aetolian movement into the Peloponnese occurred in the mid-11th century B.C. If the rule of Diomedes resulted from this movement, then a post-mid-11th century setting would be indicated, but of course an Aetolian Diomedes could have arrived earlier and married into the ruling dynasty at Tiryns or Mycenae (cf. FINKELBERG [supra n. 28] 80-81).

124 DICKINSON (supra n. 20) 210.

125 *Il.* 2.108.

126 *Il.* 2.559-567.

127 While many scholars have accepted as axiomatic that the "descent" refers to the arrival of the Dorians from the North and in particular the vicinity of Doris, C. Doumas has proposed that the descent refers to mountaineers descending to the valleys and occupying former Mycenaean sites. He notes, *inter alia*, that the ancients in general had no concept of North as being "up" on a map; that J. Chadwick and others have argued on linguistic grounds that Dorians were always present—now perhaps a minority view; and that according to legend Codrus, the last king of Athens, in order to penetrate the Dorian camp disguised himself as a woodsman (C. DOUMAS, "Η κάθοδος τῶν Δωριέων: Μία νέα πρόταση ἑρμηνείας," *Πρακτικά του Ε' Διεθνούς Συνεδρίου Πελοποννησιακῶν Σπουδῶν* [Ἄργος-Ναύπλιον 6-10 Σεπτεμβρίου 1995], Vol. 1 [1997] 184-185). On this schema, Mycenaean would have driven the former occupants of coastal and lowland areas to the hills, and to be driven out in turn and forced to retreat to places such as inland hilly Arcadia and to Cyprus, where the dialects in historical times were similar to each other and close to the Mycenaean of the Linear B tablets.

128 MAGGIDIS (supra n. 93).

129 V. ADRYMI-SISMANI, "Volos," "Dimini," *ArchDelt B Chron* 53 (1988) 407-409, 411-414; J. WHITLEY, "Dimini," "Volos," *AR* 51 (2005) 59-61. The *Iliad* describes Iolkos as "strong-founded" (*Il.* 2.712). The Palatial period IIIA and IIB site of Dimini, today about 4 km. from the coast, occupies over 10 hectares and contains substantial megaroid houses on both sides of a wide street. On the hill adjoining the settlement there are Mycenaean tholos tombs, including one large well-built tomb with a relieving triangle dated to LH IIB2, at the end of the 13th century B.C. The nearby site of Kastro goes on, however, and appears to flourish in IIC (A. BATZIOU-EUSTATHIOU, "Η Υστεροελλαδική ΙΙΙΓ στο Κάστρο του Βόλου," in N. KYPARISSI-APOSTOLIKA and M. PAPAKONSTANTINOY (eds), *The Periphery of the Mycenaean World. 2nd International Interdisciplinary Colloquium, 26-30 September, Lamia* [2003] 257).

of the pottery found in the destruction horizons—Boeotia a little before the Argolid, followed by Pylos—but recent scholarship is skeptical.¹³⁰ The prospect that the stylistic changes in the pottery of IIC Early originate in Cyprus or Crete add a further dimension of uncertainty with respect to the time of arrival and adoption of IIC shapes and motifs elsewhere. Mountjoy suggests that IIC fashions seem to occur earlier in the East Aegean-West Anatolian Interface than on the mainland.¹³¹ In addition to questions concerning the description and context of pots and potsherds, the uncertainty as to how much time elapses before a potter or potters in one location adopt small changes in shapes or decorative motifs from pottery produced elsewhere or before an itinerant potter arrives must also be considered, along with the uncertain length of time between the arrival or creation of a pot and its deposition in the layer from which it was eventually excavated. Attempts to relate the destructions in Greece chronologically to the Troy VIIa destruction which Korfmann thought the likely horizon of the Trojan War also suffer from this difficulty.

In Homer, the island of Salamis is identified as the home of the Greater Ajax.¹³² Until recently, no significant Mycenaean site was known on the island. The discovery by Lolos of the site of Kanakia, on a commanding hillside with several massive stone buildings of many rooms, some still awaiting excavation, and its evidence of foreign contacts, for example, in the form of a bronze scale-plate from a military corselet stamped with the name of Ramses II (1279-1213 B.C.) and a fragment of a copper oxhide ingot whose metal source has been identified as Apliki in Cyprus, is still another significant recent development.¹³³ Kanakia is also abandoned at the beginning of IIC Early. All entrances, including entrances to storerooms, are blocked and there is one metal hoard, suggesting that perhaps Kanakia's inhabitants hoped to return, expecting a raid or a temporary occupation which instead proved permanent, or that its inhabitants did not realize how far they would be going.¹³⁴ Ancient traditions assert that refugees from the island of Salamis founded the city of Salamis in Cyprus.

Attacks from the North and/or from Sea Peoples, internal strife within and between states, repeated and widespread earthquakes, plague, climate change resulting in crop failure, economic distress caused by incessant building programs (perhaps accompanied by the alienation of the populace), and collapse of foreign trade have all been proposed as potential causes of the end of Mycenaean palatial civilization, individually and in combination and perhaps differing in different areas. In Crete, coastal sites are abandoned and people move to defensible positions inland, whereas in the Argolid, Laconia and East Locris the number of inland sites decreases rapidly, while some coastal sites continue, and Tiryns expands. In Cyprus, some coastal sites are abandoned, others continue, and two new defensible coastal sites, Maa-Palaeokastro and Pyla-Kokkinokremos, are occupied around 1200 B.C. but shortly

130 I am most grateful to Dr. Elizabeth French for discussing this matter with me. For useful recent summaries of the problems, see S. VITALE, "The LH IIIB-LH IIC Transition on the Mycenaean Mainland: Ceramic Phases and Terminology," *Hesperia* 75 (2006) 177-204, and especially J. LEBEGYEV, "Dating of the Destruction Horizon of the Mycenaean Palaces by Decorated Ceramics," *ActaArch* 55 (2004) 239-278, who concludes that the destructions all occurred during the IIB-IIC transitional phase, within about a decade of one another.

131 MOUNTJOY (*supra* n. 78) 33-67.

132 M.L. West describes Ajax as a survival from an earlier Mycenaean period, citing his tower shield, his association with older metrical forms, the fact that Ajax is associated on six occasions with Idomeneus, and other factors (WEST [*supra* n. 50] 158-159).

133 Y. LOLOS, "Τάλαντο χαλκού από την Σαλαμίνα," *Ενάλια* 6 (2002) 73-80. I am most grateful to Prof. Yannis Lolos for showing me the site and for his detailed explication of his discovery.

134 Y. LOLOS, "The Mycenaean Capital of Salamis: Archaeology and History," abstract of paper presented at the *National Archaeological Museum, Athens, 27 March 2006*; J. WHITLEY, "Salamis: Kanakia," *AR* 50 (2004) 9-11; "Salamis: Kanakia," *AR* 51 (2005) 10; Y. LOLOS, "Cypro-Mycenaean Relations ca. 1200 B.C.: Point Iria in the Gulf of Argos and Old Salamis in the Saronic Gulf," in N.C. STAMPOLIDIS and V. KARAGEORGHIS (eds), *Ploes . . . Sea Routes . . . Interconnections in the Mediterranean, 16th-6th c. B.C. Proceedings of the International Symposium Held at Rethymnon, Crete, September 29th-October 2nd 2002* (2003) 104-113. Other possible explanations for the existence of bronze hoards—e.g., foundation or other ritual deposits—are considered in A.B. KNAPP, J. MUHLY and P.M. MUHLY, "To Hoard is Human: Late Bronze Age Metal Deposits in Cyprus and the Aegean," *RDAC* Pt. 1 (1988) 233-262; C.J. LYNN, "Suggested Archaeological and Architectural Examples of Tripartite Structures," *JIES* 34 (2006) 118-123.

abandoned.¹³⁵ By this time, but beginning toward the end of LH IIIB, the full panoply of northern military equipment, from the Naue II type sword to spearheads, shields, helmet types and perhaps Northern greaves, appears in Greece, along with handmade burnished pottery similar to that known in the North and in Italy.¹³⁶ The Italian peninsula and Anatolia also receive northern arrivals and impulses at this time.¹³⁷ If this is the chronological horizon of a Trojan war, then it is possible to imagine various reasons for warfare between Wilusa and Ahhiyawa at this time, from the structural—for example, the need to replace lost sources of grain supply—to the personal, even if strategically irrational, resulting in reciprocal raids.

History, of course, provides examples of major expeditions or offensives mounted in times of great stress (and even on the brink of collapse), from the Sicilian Expedition of the Peloponnesian War to the German Ardennes Offensive near the end of World War II. Moreover, very little time need separate an expedition against Troy from the destruction of Pylos, for example. Thucydides recounts that the return of the Greeks from Troy took many years, during which civil wars occurred in most cities, causing the movement of people to new places.¹³⁸ Indeed, in some respects the Trojan saga and its aftermath of the travels of its heroes to Cilicia, Cyprus, Libya and Italy seems to fit best in the world of the Sea Peoples at the end of LH IIIB/beginning of IIIC.¹³⁹ In this hypothesis, Odysseus' Cretan lies might reflect the Sea Peoples' defeat in Egypt and their years of wandering in Egypt and Canaan (Phoenicia), particularly if one allows poetic license in the form of exaggeration for the numbers reported in the Catalogue of Ships.¹⁴⁰ Cross-cultural studies of epic poetry composed by bards suggest that periods of displacement and movement of peoples frequently produce epic poetry recalling better times. In this respect, it is perhaps relevant that genealogies in Homer run backward for a generation or two, but never forward to a future dynasty.

V. The Late Helladic IIIC Post-Palatial Period, c. 1200-1100 B.C. – New Sites in North-Central Greece in Relation to the Epics

A period about a half-century after the destructions which mark the end of the full Mycenaean Palatial period has indeed been proposed as the appropriate setting for a Trojan expedition such as that described in Homer. S. Deger-Jalkotzy suggests that it is IIIC Middle in particular which provides a suitable milieu,

- 135 K. NOWICKI, *Defensible Sites in Crete c. 1200-800 B.C. (LM IIIB/IIIC through Early Geometric)* (*Aegaeum* 21, 2000) 228-235; J. MARAN, "Coming to Terms with the Past: Ideology and Power in Late Helladic IIIC," in *Ancient Greece* (*supra* n. 33) 123-150; V. KARAGEORGHIS, "Patterns of Fortified Settlements in the Aegean and Cyprus c. 1200 B.C.," in V. KARAGEORGHIS and C.E. MORRIS (eds), *Defensive Settlements of the Aegean and the Eastern Mediterranean after c. 1200 B.C. Proceedings of an International Workshop Held at Trinity College Dublin, 7th-9th May, 1999* (2001) 1-4; NOWICKI (*supra*) 251-254.
- 136 H.W. CATLING, "A New Bronze Sword from Cyprus," *Antiquity* 35 (1961) 121. See, e.g., I. KILIAN-DIRLMEIER, *Die Schwerter in Griechenland (ausserhalb der Peloponnes), Bulgarien und Albanien Prähistorische Bronzefunde*, Pt. 4, Vol. 12 (1993) 94-106; J. RUTTER, "Ceramic Evidence for Northern Intruders in Southern Greece at the Beginning of the Late Helladic IIIC Period," *AJA* 79 (1975) 17-32; "Some Comments on Interpreting the Dark-surfaced Handmade Burnished Pottery of the 13th and 12th Century B.C. Aegean," *JMA* 3 (1990) 29-49; S. DEGER-JALKOTZY, *Fremde Zuwanderer im spätmykenischen Griechenland* (1977); "Das Problem der 'Handmade Burnished Ware' von Myk. IIIC," in S. DEGER-JALKOTZY (ed.), *Griechenland, die Ägäis und die Levante während der 'Dark Ages' vom 12. bis zum 9. Jh. v. Chr. Akten des Symposiums von Stift Zwettl 11.-14. Oktober 1980* (1983) 161-178; J. RUTTER, "Prehistoric Archaeology of the Aegean" (http://projectsx.dartmouth.edu/classics/history/bronze_age). Greaves were of course already in existence in Greece, as shown by the Dendra panoply of LH IIIA1 (E. VERMEULE, *Greece in the Bronze Age* [1964] 135).
- 137 The Northern/Italian inspired military equipment, fibulae and pottery, followed by the putative descent of the Dorians of Greek tradition, may represent an example of a historical pattern whereby outsiders arrive first as mercenaries, then as raiders, and finally as settlers. With respect to putative mercenaries, see J. DRIESSEN and C. MACDONALD, "Some Military Aspects of the Aegean in the Late Fifteenth and Early Fourteenth Centuries B.C.," *BSA* 79 (1984) 49-56.
- 138 Thuc. 1.12
- 139 VERMEULE (*supra* n. 136) 278.
- 140 *Il.* 2.493-760. E. COOK notes that the reference to Egypt may reflect mercenary voyages of the 7th century B.C. in the reign of Psamtik (*supra* n. 23] 169 and personal communication, for which I am most grateful).

... with its apparently warlike ruling stratum looking back with nostalgia to the age of the palaces, together with the work of epic bards at these courts, evidenced in vase paintings—all this suggests that the illiterate Mycenaean age without palaces, and particularly the courts of minor princes . . . played a significant role in the development of the early Greek epic.¹⁴¹

The famed Warrior Vase from Mycenae of IIIC Middle date, with its line of warriors marching off, provides a vivid picture of these times.¹⁴² The 2006 excavation season at Kalapodi uncovered fragments from three LH IIIC kraters showing warriors, one of them depicting a siege of a city or fortress with a man climbing up a ladder to the top of a wall.¹⁴³ Recent excavations at Lefkandi have produced IIIC sherds depicting warriors as well, including two sherds of warriors on ships; the original excavations produced sherds depicting chariots as well as warriors, one of whom appears to be armed with a Naue II type sword.¹⁴⁴ Other IIIC sherds from the Argolid and Achaea depict chariots. Of course this and all other depictions may refer to past rather than current events, or for that matter to mythical accounts. It should be noted also that warrior tombs are the exception in IIIC, not the rule. At Perati, for example, only two tombs out of 219 were warrior burials. Deger-Jalkotzy believes that the display of weapons in a burial was the exclusive prerogative of rulers.¹⁴⁵

The excavations of recent years have provided a much fuller picture of Mycenae and Tiryns in the LH IIIC period. At Mycenae, evidence of IIIC occupation has been found especially in the eastern and western sectors of the citadel, including at the House of Columns, the Cult Center, the South House, and the Granary. Particularly important are the findings from the excavation of the so-called Hellenistic Tower. Beneath the Hellenistic floor are several floors found within three clear strata, all containing pottery sherds of IIIC style, and even a large fragment of a fresco.¹⁴⁶ Near Mycenae at Khandia, E. Palaiologou has excavated a tumulus that contained urns with cremated remains (as in the burial of Patroclus in the *Iliad*) and finds dating to IIIC Middle and Late.¹⁴⁷

At Tiryns, the current excavations of J. Maran have disclosed much additional information about the IIIC settlement of the 12th century B.C. The Lower Town of Tiryns increases substantially in size in IIIC, perhaps particularly during IIIC Middle, extending over a minimum of twenty-five hectares.¹⁴⁸ The settlement is well organized, with passageways separating buildings

- 141 S. DEGER-JALKOTZY, "Die Erforschung des Zusammenbruchs der sogenannten mykenischen Kultur und der sogenannten dunklen Jahrhunderte," in *Zweihundert Jahre Homer-Forschung* (*supra* n. 5) 148f (translated in LATA CZ [*supra* n. 11] 275).
- 142 For this and other IIIC kraters depicting warriors, see: F. SCHACHERMEYR, *Die ägäische Frühzeit 4: Griechenland im Zeitalter der Wanderungen vom Ende der mykenischen Ära bis auf die Dorer* (1980) pls. 31-34; E. VERMEULE and V. KARAGEORGHIS, *Mycenaean Pictorial Vase Painting* (1982) XI.1A-64; K. KILIAN, "Mycenaean Charioteers Again," *Antiquity* 56 (1982) 205-206; W. GÜNTNER, *Tiryns XII: Figürlich bemalte mykenische Keramik aus Tiryns* (2000) 23-26, pls. 6.3a-b, 7.1a-d, 8.1a-b; F. DAKORONIA, "War-Ships on Sherds of LH IIIC Kraters from Kynos," in *Tropis II. 2nd International Symposium on Ship Construction in Antiquity, Delphi 1987* (1990) 117-122; "Kynos...Fleet," in *Tropis IV. Proceedings of the 4th International Symposium on Ship Construction in Antiquity, Athens 1991* (1996) 159-171; "Representations of Sea-Battles on Mycenaean Sherds from Kynos," in *Tropis V. 5th International Symposium on Ship Construction in Antiquity, Nauplia 1993* (1999) 119-128; J. CROUWEL, "Fighting on Land and Sea in Late Mycenaean Times," in R. LAFFINEUR (ed.), *POLEMOS: Le contexte guerrier en Égée à l'âge du Bronze. Actes de la 7^e Rencontre égéenne internationale, Université de Liège, 14-17 avril 1998, Aegaeum 19* (1999) 455-463; M. WEDDE, "War at Sea: The Mycenaean and Early Iron Age Oared Galley," in *ibid.* 465-476.
- 143 W.-D. NIEMEIER, personal communication of 21 August 2006, for which I am most grateful.
- 144 I.S. LEMOS quoted in J. WHITLEY, "Lefkandi," *AR* 51 (2005) 51; J. CROUWEL, "Late Mycenaean Pictorial Pottery," in D. EVELY (ed.), *Lefkandi IV: The Bronze Age. The Late Helladic IIIC Settlement at Xeropolis* (2006) 238-241 and pl. 58a. I thank H.W. Catling for the reference to Crouwel.
- 145 S. DEGER-JALKOTZY, "Late Mycenaean Warrior Tombs," in *Ancient Greece* (*supra* n. 33) 152.
- 146 S. IAKOVIDIS, "Late Helladic III C at Mycenae," in *LH III C Chronology and Synchronisms* (*supra* n. 123) 117-123.
- 147 S. DEGER-JALKOTZY, "Decline, Destruction, Aftermath," in *Cambridge Companion to the Aegean Bronze Age* (forthcoming).
- 148 MARAN (*supra* n. 135) 123-150; K. KILIAN, "Zum Ende der mykenischen Epoche in der Argolis," *JRGZM* 27 (1980) 166-195; "La caduta dei palazzi micenei continentali: Aspetti archeologici," in D. MUSTI (ed.), *Le Origini dei Greci: Dori e mondo Egeo* (1985) 73-95; "Mycenaean Up to Date, Trends and Changes in Recent Research," in *Problems in Greek Prehistory* (*supra* n. 67) 115-152.

constructed around courtyards.¹⁴⁹ Deger-Jalkotzy has suggested that such structures constitute *oikoi* such as those described in Homer, a conclusion Maran finds attractive.¹⁵⁰ Tiryns' ties to the palatial past are indicated by the large number of heirlooms, some going back to the Shaft Grave period, found in the Tiryns Treasure.¹⁵¹ Maran, after a recent reexamination of the evidence concerning its discovery in the light of further research in the area, concludes that the treasure was probably either the possession of a single family or a dedication. He adds as a speculation that "through tales linked to these special objects reminiscences of the Palatial period were integrated into the cultural memory of the so-called Dark Age, and that in this way the emerging epic traditions glorifying the past were enhanced."¹⁵² IIC also fits the latter of the two descriptions of rule in the northeast Peloponnese in Homer, in which Diomedes is given rule of Tiryns,¹⁵³ independent of Mycenae, for in IIC Tiryns is the sole former palatial site which seems to grow in population, whereas it seems unlikely that Tiryns was not a part of a Mycenaean kingdom in LH IIIA and B.¹⁵⁴ Indeed, Homer earlier in the same book of the *Iliad*¹⁵⁵ describes Agamemnon as the ruler of all Argos and many islands, perhaps another indication that the *Iliad* combines elements of different periods.

In addition to the depictions of warfare noted above, warrior burials exist in IIC. They occur in particular in Achaea, which M. Finkelberg believes was the gathering place during IIC of the Aeolic speakers who later founded colonies in the Aegean islands and Anatolia.¹⁵⁶ Janko and others, however, believe the Aeolic speakers went directly from Phocis, East Locris, the Northern Euboean Gulf and southeastern Thessaly to the East. (The Late Helladic IIC pottery *hoine* in this area is discussed below.) In later Achaean legend as summarized by Polybius (himself an Achaean), Tisamenos, the son of Orestes and the last pre-Dorian ruler of Laconia, who had been expelled from Sparta upon the return of the Heraclidae, succeeded in occupying Achaea with his followers.¹⁵⁷ Homer, of course, refers to the Greek forces collectively as Achaeans (and also as Argives and Danaoi). In contrast to the heirlooms and foreign exotica present in the Achaean IIC warrior tombs and reminiscent of the grander past, the military equipment buried is up-to-date¹⁵⁸ and of the Northern and Italic type. T.J. Papadopoulos has observed that LH IIC Achaean pottery and other artifacts are present not only in the eastern Aegean and in the north of Greece, but also in the West in Italy, perhaps indicative of wide-ranging maritime activities.¹⁵⁹

149 MARAN (*supra* n. 135) 123-150.

150 S. DEGER-JALKOTZY, "Diskontinuität und Kontinuität: Aspekte politischer und sozialer Organisation in mykenischer Zeit und in der Welt der Homerischen Epen," in *La transizione dal Miceneo all'alto Arcaismo* (*supra* n. 95) 59; MARAN (*supra* n. 135) 125-126. See also K. KILLAN, "Civiltà Micenea in Grecia: Nuovi aspetti storici ed interculturali," in L. VAGNETTI (ed.), *Magna Grecia e Mondo Miceneo: Atti del ventiduesimo convegno di studi sulla Magna Grecia, Taranto, 7-11 October 1982* (1983) 76-77; KILLAN (*supra* n. 148, 1985) 75-77.

151 MARAN (*supra* n. 135) 129-131.

152 MARAN (*supra* n. 135) 141-142. H.W. Catling, on the other hand, interprets the Tiryns Treasure as a metalworker's hoard, noting among other factors that as to the Type II swords, one is hiltless and the other unfinished and that one of the three tripod legs from the putative cauldron does not match the other two (H.W. Catling, personal communication of 20 November 2006, for which I am most grateful, citing also H. MATTHÄUS, *Die Bronzegefäße der kretisch-mykenischen Kultur* [1980] pls. 11, 12, nos. 83, 84). Catling suggests the owner of the deposit was interested in the value of the raw materials—copper, bronze, gold, ivory, amber—and was indifferent to the objects' erstwhile function.

153 *Il.* 2.559-567. See also *supra* n. 123.

154 See, e.g., E. HALLAGER, "A Palace Without Sealings?" in K. VON FOLSACH, H. THRANE and I. THUESEN (eds), *From Handaxe to Khan: Essays presented to Peder Mortensen on the Occasion of his 70th Birthday* (2004) 162; MARAN (*supra* n. 93) 275 and "Continuity and Change: Tiryns from the 13th to the 12th Centuries B.C.," paper presented at the *New York Aegean Bronze Age Colloquium, Institute of Fine Arts, New York, 18 May 2005*, who notes in particular that the stone for some of the palatial constructions at Tiryns in IIIB1 around 1250 B.C. comes from the vicinity of Mycenae.

155 *Il.* 2.108.

156 M. FINKELBERG, *Greeks and Pre-Greeks: Aegean Prehistory and Greek Heroic Tradition* (2005) 127-139; "Greek Epic Tradition on Population Movements in Bronze Age Greece," in *POLEMOS* (*supra* n. 142) 31-36.

157 Polyb. 2.41; see FINKELBERG (*supra* n. 28) 82. Founders of Aeolian colonies in Asia Minor claimed to be descendants of Orestes' son Penthiolos.

158 DEGER-JALKOTZY (*supra* n. 147).

159 T.J. PAPAPOPOULOS, "Warrior-Graves in Achaean Mycenaean Cemeteries," in *POLEMOS* (*supra* n. 142) 267-274.

Naxos, Perati, Rhodes and Kos also flourish in IIC Middle, and Xeropolis at Lefkandi shows signs of wealth and wide trade contacts. The ancient sanctuary of Ayia Irini on Kea comes back into use in LH IIC Late.¹⁶⁰ Rhodes and Kos provide contingents in the *Iliad*, whereas the Homeric epics know nothing of the earlier, long-lived Mycenaean settlement at Miletus (Millawanda) or any of the other Mycenaean IIB sites on the Anatolian coast. The *Iliad* refers instead to Carians speaking a barbaric language in these places.¹⁶¹ At Bademgedigi Tepe, south of Izmir, a few kilometers inland from the Mediterranean, excavations in 2001 revealed over 800 Mycenaean sherds, none of them obviously earlier than IIC, but representing all IIC phases. Bademgedigi Tepe is believed to be the ancient Puranda mentioned in the Hittite texts as a city of Arzawa, but may have fallen out of Hittite control after the reign of Mursili II.¹⁶² Homer, and indeed Greek tradition *in toto*, is silent on the Hittites and the people of Arzawa, Mira and the Seha River Land, the poleis alongside which the Mycenaean of the Anatolian interface lived. The Cyclades are absent from the *Iliad*; in this respect, the *Iliad* could be a reflection of the low point in the islands' fortune at the end of IIC, instead of the IIC Middle period. Cyprus, which experiences a number of destructions and abandonments of various sites around the middle of the 13th century B.C., nevertheless plays a prominent role in the trade with Greece at the end of the Palatial period in LH IIB (as shown by finds from Tiryns and the Point Iria shipwreck, for example), is present in IIC Middle exchanges as indicated by the finds at Perati and Lefkandi, and is again prominent in Mediterranean exchange and trade in the later 11th and 10th centuries, but is mentioned in passing only once in the *Iliad* and three times in the *Odyssey*.¹⁶³ Cyprus and its trade connections seem to suffer a brief setback at the end of Late Cypriot IIIA, perhaps early in the 11th century B.C.¹⁶⁴

It is with regard to the LH IIC period in particular that recent archaeological discoveries in north-central Greece, particularly in East and West Locris and Phocis, have shed much new light. The excavation by F. Dakoronia of Pyrgos Livanates in East Locris, in all likelihood the site of Kynos, the home of the Lesser Ajax in the *Iliad*, has disclosed a major LH IIC site with an extensive building complex, stout walls, substantial kilns, evidence of metallurgy and significant grain-storage capability. Only a small part of this large site has been excavated to date. The pottery produced at the site includes vessels with striking depictions of ships, warriors and sea battles. The ships depicted appear to include both wide-bodied merchantmen and narrow warships. A terracotta ship model recovered in the excavation may originally have contained fifty oars, matching the description of ships in Homer.¹⁶⁵ The site sits on top of a defensible hillside near the ancient shoreline of the Euboean Gulf, overlooking a fine harbor. Dakoronia believes that the citadel of Kynos guards a still larger settlement nearby at Palaikastro, located at the junction of major roadways. (Whether Kynos was a site of significance prior to LH IIC is yet to be determined. Because of the importance of consolidating and preserving the architectural remains of this period, there has been little opportunity to investigate earlier

160 D. EVELY, *Lefkandi IV* (*supra* n. 144); S. DEGER-JALKOTZY, "The Aegean Islands and the Breakdown of the Mycenaean Palaces around 1200 B.C.," in V. KARAGEORGHIS and N. STAMPOLIDIS (eds), *Eastern Mediterranean: Cyprus-Dodecanese-Crete, 16th-6th cent. B.C. Proceedings of the International Symposium, Rethymnon 13-16 May 1997* (1998) 115.

161 *Il.* 2.867.

162 R. MERİÇ and P.A. MOUNTJOY, "Mycenaean Pottery from Bademgedigi Tepe [Puranda] in Ionia: A Preliminary Report," *IstMitt* 52 (2002) 79-98.

163 *Il.* 11.21; *Od.* 4.83, 8.363, 17.442-449. There is a possible fourth reference in *Od.* 1.184, if the Temese of the text is the Temese of Cyprus. I am grateful to E. Cook for calling the reference to Temese to my attention. For the mid-13th century horizon, see M. IACOVOU, "From the Mycenaean *qa-si-re-u* to the Cypriote *pa-si-le-wo-se*: The *Basileus* in the Kingdom of Cyprus," in *Ancient Greece* (*supra* n. 33) 326.

164 J.P. CRIELAARD, "Surfing on the Mediterranean Web: Cypriote Long-distance Communications during the Eleventh and Tenth Centuries B.C.," in *Eastern Mediterranean: Cyprus-Dodecanese-Crete* (*supra* n. 160) 191; for chronology, see P.A. MOUNTJOY, "The End of the Bronze Age at Enkomi, Cyprus: The Problem of Level III B," *BSA* 100 (2005) esp. 163-166 and table 7.

165 F. DAKORONIA, "Mycenaean East Locris: Warships and Sea Battles Depicted on Kraters and Other Discoveries," paper presented at the *New York Aegean Bronze Age Colloquium, Institute of Fine Arts, New York, 6 March 1997*; *Il.* 2.719-720. A depiction of a similar oared galley appears on an angular alabaston of LH IIC Late (around 1100 B.C.) found in a reused LH IIIA tholos tomb at Tragana near the palace of Pylos (EDER [*supra* n. 123] 550).

strata, but the site has produced some sherds of LH IIIB and perhaps IIIA2.¹⁶⁶) The site of Mitrou on the Euboean Gulf is also rich in IIIC as well as Protogeometric material, but with no evidence to date of occupation in the palatial IIIB period. IIIB as well as earlier material is reported, however, from the low hill of Glyfa on the coast opposite Chalcis. The location suggests that the site may be the Aulis of the *Iliad*, the gathering place of the Greek fleet.¹⁶⁷

Phocis has also produced many rich cemeteries of IIIC Middle. Chamber tombs of archetypal form appear, complete with burial chamber, dromos and entrance. The tombs of northeast Phocis have yielded weapons and gold.¹⁶⁸ At Amphikleia-Ayioi Anargyroi on the lower slope of Mt. Parnassos in what is now the district of Phthiotis, eleven IIIC to Submycenaean chamber tombs have been excavated.¹⁶⁹ At Koufia Rachi in what is now the nome of Karditsa, cleaning of the tholos of a Mycenaean chamber tomb has yielded IIIB-C painted pottery and precocities outside the tomb, including gold and glass beads, rock crystal, three sealstones and a gold ring bearing a representation of two griffins.¹⁷⁰ Prior to the discoveries of recent years, O. Dickinson questioned whether the Mycenaean elements known from this area indicated a true Mycenaean presence, or rather the adoption of certain features of Mycenaean life by a local population. Dakoronia, however, has stated her belief that on the basis of the results obtained from her excavations, “[the] inhabitants were Mycenaean, reacted as Mycenaean, and felt like Mycenaean, for they showed the same taste, habits and way of life.”¹⁷¹ B.A. Feuer believes the same to be true of Thessaly, while noting the persistence of certain local Thessalian burial traditions.¹⁷² Deger-Jalkotzy has observed that Phocis, parts of Locris and particularly the North Euboean Gulf seem to flourish when the Mycenaean palaces and especially Thebes are weak or gone.¹⁷³ The sites in the Euboean Gulf and the surrounding area extending as far as Kalapodi reveal a pottery *koine* in LH IIIC. Some areas of Phocis do not appear to suffer IIIC destructions,¹⁷⁴ and the sanctuary at Kalapodi receives offerings of all periods, suggesting the possibility of continuous transmission of memories in this area. Kalapodi controls the pass of Hyampolis between the Corinthian Gulf and Thessaly on the main route into Phocis. The shrine may have served as a meeting place or even a regional center.¹⁷⁵ It is only in recent years

- 166 F. DAKORONIA, personal communication. I most warmly thank Dr. Fanouria Dakoronia for leading me on a tour of her sites and finds in museum storerooms in Phocis and East Locris.
- 167 E. ZAHOU and A. VAN DE MOORTELE quoted in J. WHITLEY, “Mitrou,” *AR* 51 (2005) 53; “Mitrou,” *AR* 52 (2006) 64-66; A. SAMPSON, “Aulis mycénienne et la route maritime de l’Égée du Nord,” in *MELETEMATATA* 741-745. In addition, J. COLEMAN has reported the existence of significant scatters of Mycenaean sherds at two sites on ridges of hills in East Locris, one above Vichada Bay (personal communication, for which I am most grateful).
- 168 F. DAKORONIA, “Ερευνώντας δύο ‘περιφέρειες’: Ανατολική Λοκρίδα και ΒΑ Φωκίδα. Ομοιοτητες και διαφορές,” in *The Periphery of the Mycenaean World* (*supra* n. 129) 345.
- 169 R. HOPE SIMPSON and O.T.P.K. DICKINSON, *A Gazetteer of Aegean Civilization in the Bronze Age*, Vol. 1, *The Mainland and Islands* (1979) 260-261; H.W. CATLING, “Locris: Amphikleia,” *AR* 18 (1972) 13; “Locris: Amphikleia,” *AR* 20 (1974) 20; E.B. FRENCH, “Amphikleia,” *AR* 37 (1991) 44; R.A. TOMLINSON, “Amphikleia: Verantzana,” *AR* 42 (1996) 23; D. BLACKMAN, “Amphikleia,” *AR* 47 (2001) 79.
- 170 J. WHITLEY, “Xeroneri/Georgiko,” *AR* 52 (2006) 75-76.
- 171 DAKORONIA (*supra* n. 168) 344.
- 172 B.A. FEUER, *The Northern Mycenaean Border in Thessaly* (1983) 202.
- 173 S. DEGER-JALKOTZY, “On the Negative Aspects of the Mycenaean Palace System,” in *Atti e Memorie del Secondo Congresso Internazionale di Micenologia, Roma-Napoli, 14-20 ottobre 1991*, Vol. 2 (1996) 727-728; A. VLACHOPOULOS, “Naxos and the Cyclades in the Late Helladic IIIC Period,” *BICS* 42 (1997-1998) 237-238; A. VAN DE MOORTELE, personal communication of 14 September 2005.
- 174 LATACZ (*supra* n. 11) 276-277. The Thebes Linear B tablets indicate a strong Theban palatial interest in Euboea in the preceding IIIB period, including the possibility that certain Euboean sites may be under Theban control (V.L. ARAVANTINOS, M. DEL FREO, L. GODART and A. SACCONI, *Thèbes: Fouilles de la Cadmée IV* [2005] 22 [TH Fq 214.13], 30 [TH Fq 254+255.7], 85 [TH Gp 197.2], 87 [TH Gp 227.1], 88 [TH Gp 231.2]) or at least participating in Theban festivals (PALAIMA [*supra* n. 17]); see also J.T. KILLEN, “Thoughts on the Functions of the New Thebes Tablets,” in S. DEGER-JALKOTZY and O. PANAGL (eds), *Die neuen Linear B-Texte aus Theben: Ihr Aufschlusswert für die mykenische Sprache und Kultur. Akten des internationalen Forschungskolloquiums an der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 5.-6. Dezember 2002* (2006) 81-82, 88-89, 108.
- 175 C. MORGAN, “From Palace to Polis? Religious Developments on the Greek Mainland During the Bronze Age/ Iron Age Transition,” in P. HELLSTRÖM and B. AIROTH (eds), *Religion and Power in the Ancient Greek World. Proceedings of the Uppsala Symposium 1993* (Bonn. Uppsala Studies in Ancient Mediterranean and

that the development of north-central Greece has brought in its wake increased construction of buildings and highways, leading to fortuitous archaeological discoveries of significance. The area may have more surprises in store.

The recent discoveries in Phocis, Locris, Phthiotis and Iolkos may address what had previously seemed a problem for proponents of the historicity of a Bronze Age Trojan expedition, namely the paucity of Bronze Age sites in an area which is home to such major protagonists of the *Iliad* as Achilles himself, Patroclus, Lesser Ajax, Philoctetes and Protesilaus. (Of course for those who regard the entire tale, or at least the existence of its main actors, as a grand fiction, the answer to the problem is clear: the poet locates his heroes in distant realms rather than in Athens, Argos, Thebes or Euboea because their names would have been unfamiliar in those local traditions). To conclude the discussion of the LH IIIC period, we may note that the island of Chios, the home of the Homeridae and by some accounts of Homer, provides evidence of Mycenaean presence in LH IIIC Middle and Late. A complete range of IIIC fine ware, but also cooking ware, is present, as well as a number of clay figurines of probable psi-type and bovines. Whether the intriguing finds from Emporio on Chios indicate the existence of a IIIC Middle to Late Mycenaean colony is uncertain, however.¹⁷⁶

VI. The Protogeometric Period and Its Epics

We turn finally to the possibility that a battle, raid or skirmish involving Greeks at Troy in the course of the initial Greek colonization of the Anatolian coast in the Protogeometric period may be reflected in the Homeric epics. Troy itself provides sufficient possible destruction horizons to accommodate all views. One such horizon occurs at the end of Troy VIIb₃, dated by the excavator to c. 1000-950 B.C. on the basis of pottery and radiocarbon evidence. (The extent of the damage at this time has been disputed, as noted above. Korfmann, the excavator, saw evidence of a general destruction, while Basedow proposes that burning occurred in one area, perhaps of a ritual nature, whereas B. Rose concludes that there is no burnt level in Troy VIIb₃ but only later in late Geometric/very early Archaic.¹⁷⁷) *Buckelkeramik* or Knobbed Ware is already much in evidence in Troy VIIb₃, indicating the arrival of people from the northeast.¹⁷⁸

Near Eastern Civilizations 24, 1996) 47; P. ELLINGER, "Hyampolis et le sanctuaire d'Artémis Elaphébolos dans l'histoire, la légende et l'espace de la Phocide," in R.C.S. FELSCH *et al.*, "Kalapodi. Bericht über die Grabungen im Heiligtum der Artemis Elaphebolos und des Apollon von Hyampolis 1978-1982," *AA* (1987) 88-99; P. ELLINGER, *La légende nationale Phocidienne* (BCH, suppl. 27, 1993); R.C.S. FELSCH, "Mykenischer Kult im Heiligtum bei Kalapodi?" in R. HÄGG and N. MARINATOS (eds), *Sanctuaries and Cults in the Aegean Bronze Age. Proceedings of the First International Symposium at the Swedish Institute in Athens, 12-13 May, 1980* (1981) 82; F. DAKORONIA, "Homeric Towns in East Lokris: Problems of Identification," *Hesperia* 62 (1993) 115-127; "Ελάτεια," *Αρχαιολογία* 45 (1992) 20; "Ελάτεια," *Φάκικα Χρόνικα* 5 (1993) 25-39; E.B. FRENCH, "Elateia," *AR* 36 (1990) 47; F. DAKORONIA, "Ελάτεια," *ArchDelt* 40B (1985) 171; "Κύνος," *ArchDelt* 40B (1985) 173-174; "Κύνος Λιβανατών," *ArchDelt* 41B (1986) 68-69; T.G. SPYROPOULOS, "Αμφικλεία Λοκρίδος," *ArchDelt* 25B (1970) 237-240; SCHACHERMEYR (*supra* n. 142) 319-341; J. FOSSEY, *The Ancient Topography of Opountian Lokris* (1990) 99-107. For continuity from the LH IIIC tradition represented at Agnadi, see *ArchDelt* 25B (1970) 235-237.

176 Cf. M. GUZOWSKA and A. YASUR-LANDAU, "Before the Aeolians: Prolegomena to the Study of Interactions with the North-East Aegean Islands in the 13th and 12th Centuries B.C.," in *The Periphery of the Mycenaean World* (*supra* n. 129) 473 (pro) with MOUNTJOY (*supra* n. 78) 33-67 (contra). See also V.R. d'A. DESBOROUGH, *The Last Mycenaeans and Their Successors* (1964) 228; S. HOOD, "Mycenaeans in Chios," in J. BOARDMAN and C.E. VAPHOPOULOU-RICHARDSON (eds), *Chios. A Conference at the Homereion in Chios, 1984* (1986) 171. Whether there were any survivors of the site after its destruction in IIIC Late capable of passing on tales of the Heroic Age is of course a matter of pure speculation, particularly as no Protogeometric site has yet been found (except that a few sherds from Kato Phana may be PG—see J. WHITLEY, "Chios: Kato Phana," *AR* 49 [2003] 72).

177 KORFMANN (*supra* n. 2, 2000); KORFMANN (*supra* n. 2, 2001) 26-27; BASEDOW (*supra* n. 38); C.B. ROSE, "The 1998 Post-Bronze Age Excavations at Troia," *Studia Troica* 9 (1999) 37-39; see also C. ASLAN, "Ilion before Alexander: Protogeometric, Geometric, and Archaic Pottery from D9," *Studia Troica* 12 (2002) 85-87, 126, n. 36.

178 KORFMANN (*supra* n. 2, 2000); KORFMANN (*supra* n. 2, 2001) 26.

In the epics the Trojans have European allies, the Paiones, Kikones and Threikes, reaching across Macedonia and Thrace. In the *Iliad* Tros, Ilos, Priam and Aeneas are all descendants of Dardanos. West suggests that Knobbed Ware was produced by an Illyrian immigrant people known as the Dardanoi.¹⁷⁹ The *Iliad* also has the Phrygians already in Bithynia and the Sangarios River region.

In Greece the Protogeometric picture varies greatly according to region. Southern Greece in general shows evidence of a considerable break at the end of IIIC around 1100-1050 B.C., with a more or less complete abandonment of Mycenaean cemetery sites in Aetolia, Kephallenia, Achaea, Elis and Laconia, as well as abandonment of settlement/fortification sites such as Teichos Dymaion.¹⁸⁰ The Achaean trading network is disrupted, and in its place there appear elements of Balkan material culture in Epirus and Aetolia.¹⁸¹ B. Eder accordingly suggests that "if any period should be considered as a setting for the . . . migrations of the Aetolians into the western Peloponnese" recorded in myth, it should be this.¹⁸²

In central Greece, Thessaly, coastal Macedonia and Euboea, however, the situation is quite different, with indications of significant continuity at various locations¹⁸³ including the shrine at Kalapodi and the cemetery of Elateia, where individual tombs contain pottery of all periods from LH IIIA1 to Middle-Late Geometric.¹⁸⁴ Burials with *keimelia*, such as the Lefkandi Toumba burial described below or a burial on Naxos where a LH IIIC hydria was placed over covering slabs of a Late Protogeometric cist grave, may signal an intent to link these Protogeometric burials to Mycenaean ancestors, either in general or in particular.¹⁸⁵

The "Chieftain" or "Big Man" societies of the Protogeometric period have seemed to many to provide the most appropriate background for the Homeric epics.¹⁸⁶ The VIIb₃ burnt level at Troy placed at 1000-950 B.C. on radiocarbon evidence¹⁸⁷ and the great Toumba burial at Lefkandi on the island of Euboea of 1000-950 B.C. on traditional dating (but perhaps somewhat earlier if the Assiros stratigraphy and radiocarbon dating is accepted)¹⁸⁸ are perhaps the most significant chronological markers. The Toumba warrior cremation burial, in a Cypriot bronze urn made perhaps 200 years earlier, accompanied by valuable and exotic grave goods, has seemed to many to contain echoes of the burial of Patroclus in Book 23 of the *Iliad* and be generally appropriate for a Homeric leader. The male cremation was accompanied by the inhumation burial of a female; a second shaft contained the skeletons of four horses, and the whole was enclosed in an apsidal house 50 m. long, ten times the size of any known

179 WEST (*supra* n. 50) 164.

180 EDER (*supra* n. 123) 560. With regard to the Corinthia (Achaea), C. Morgan notes that "perhaps the most striking features of the mortuary record are the abandonment of quite often large Mycenaean chamber tomb cemeteries in the Corinthian countryside (some of which had been in use since Early Mycenaean times) and the ending of multiple burial, perhaps in family tombs" (C. MORGAN, "Ritual and Society in the Early Iron Age Corinthia," in R. HÄGG (ed.), *Ancient Greek Cult Practice from the Archaeological Evidence. Proceedings of the Fourth International Seminar on Ancient Greek Cult, Organized by the Swedish Institute at Athens, 22-24 October 1993* [1998] 78).

181 EDER (*supra* n. 123) 560; K. WARDLE, "Cultural Groups of the Late Bronze and Early Iron Age in North West Greece," *Godišnjak centar za Balkanološka Ispitivanja* 15 (1977) 199; T.J. PAPADOPOULOS, *Mycenaean Achaea*, Pt. 1: *Text* (1979) 180-183.

182 EDER (*supra* n. 123) 560.

183 EDER (*supra* n. 123) 560.

184 S. DEGER-JALKOTZY, "Elateia and Problems of Pottery Chronology," in E. Froussou (ed.), *Η Περιφέρεια του Μικηναϊκού Κόσμου. Α' Διεθνές Διεπιστημονικό Συμπόσιο, Λαμία, 25-29 Σεπτεμβρίου 1994* (1999) 195.

185 V.K. LAMBRINOUDAKIS, "Veneration of Ancestors in Geometric Naxos," in *Early Greek Cult Practice. Proceedings of the Fifth International Symposium at the Swedish Institute at Athens, 26-29 June, 1986* (1988) 235, 245 n. 24; J.P. CRIELAARD and J. DRIESSEN, "The Hero's Home: Some Reflections on the Building at Toumba, Lefkandi," *Topoi* 4 (1994) 266.

186 E.g., FINLEY (*supra* n. 3); J.P. CRIELAARD, "Basileis at Sea: Elites and External Contacts in the Euboean Gulf Region from the End of the Bronze Age to the Beginning of the Iron Age," in *Ancient Greece* (*supra* n. 33) 271-272; I.S. LEMOS, *The Protogeometric Aegean: The Archaeology of the Late Eleventh and Tenth Centuries BC* (2002) 217-219.

187 KORFMANN (*supra* n. 2, 2001) 26-27.

188 In this regard, see also D.L. SALTZ, *Greek Geometric Pottery in the East: The Chronological Implications* (Ph.D. thesis, Harvard University, 1978) and G. KOPCKE, personal communication of 12 February 2003 and 23 July 2004, which argue in favor of the general updating of Greek Early Iron Age pottery in the East.

contemporary house, which was then covered by a giant tumulus.¹⁸⁹ In the rich Toumba cemetery only this burial contained valuable heirlooms or *keimelia*. The ability to give and receive such gifts has been seen as a critical aspect of many Chieftain or Big Man societies (e.g., Hallstatt). The *Iliad* and *Odyssey* provide many examples of such gift-giving—for example, the boars' tusk helmet which Autolykos gives to Kytherian Amphidamas, who gives it to Molos, who gives it to his son Meriones, who in turn presents it to Odysseus,¹⁹⁰ or the gold-and-silver mixing bowl Phaidimos gives to Menelaos, who gives it to Telemachos.¹⁹¹ That the burials may reflect a trading/exchange/guest privilege relationship between the Lefkandi chieftain and a Phoenician, Syrian or Cypriot counterpart (or even a union celebrating such a relationship) is of course possible, if unprovable.¹⁹² J. Papadopoulos suggests that the Toumba burial may even be that of a Phoenician.¹⁹³ The potential implication of such exchanges or unions with respect to the Greek acquisition of the Phoenician alphabet is evident.

I. Morris concludes that

the male burial at Lefkandi Toumba is the earliest known example of a ritual package which was to define heroic status for more than a millennium. By archaizing and orientalizing, buriers connected heroes to broader and more glorious lost worlds. Singers of tales and buriers of great men worked out a shared symbolic language. A great mound was part of the hero's due (*Il.* 16.457, 671-675; 23.44-47; *Od.* 1.239-240; 14.366-371; 24.188-190), and a source of renewed honor for his descendants (*Il.* 7.79-86; 23.245-258; *Od.* 5.311; 14.366-371; 24.93-95). The hero must be cremated and buried in a metal urn.¹⁹⁴

Of course it is impossible to know if the Homeric epics describe such witnessed burials or whether the burial copied the rites described in already extant epic poetry. Surely the warrior buried in the Toumba burial would have expected to hear that the Mycenaean heroes at Troy were buried in a grand manner with rites similar to his, even if the poet was basically describing 11th-10th-century B.C. elite warrior custom.¹⁹⁵

Warrior burials are not limited, of course, to north-central Greece or to the Protogeometric period. They appear on Crete from the Subminoan period at the Knossos North Cemetery to the Geometric-Archaic at Eleutherna and in Early Iron Age cemeteries on Cyprus (Skales cemetery and perhaps Tomb 40 at Kaloriziki, where the chamber had been heavily looted but a

189 I. MORRIS, "Negotiated Peripherality in Iron Age Greece," *Journal of World System Research* 2:12 (1996) 3. Horse sacrifices are not a feature of Mycenaean palace period burials, but examples exist at Marathon in MH III and in Cyprus at Hala Sultan Tekke in the 13th century B.C.

190 *Il.* 10.260-271. H.W. Catling has proposed that the tusks found in Tomb 201 of the Protogeometric North Cemetery at Knossos represent the remains of just such a helmet, and hence a perfect example of a survival of Bronze Age prestige equipment (COLDSTREAM and CATLING [*supra* n. 57] 534-535. I am grateful to H.W. Catling for reminding me of this reference).

191 *Od.* 4.615-619. E. Cook notes that Phaidimos is Phoenician/Sidonian: thus the mixing bowl, while an exotic item illustrative of foreign contacts, is not necessarily an heirloom.

192 N. COLDSTREAM, "The First Exchanges between Euboeans and Phoenicians: Who Took the Initiative?" in *Mediterranean Peoples in Transition* (*supra* n. 93) 353-360; C.M. ANTONACCIO, "Lefkandi and Homer," in *Homer's World* (*supra* n. 20) 15-20. H.W. Catling has suggested, however, that the female burial may have been a sacrifice, with the ivory-handled knife found near her head, and further that it is possible the Toumba warrior had died abroad (perhaps in combat) and his ashes returned in an urn for burial (personal communication of 20 November 2006).

193 J.K. PAPAPOPOULOS, "Euboians in Macedonia? A Closer Look," *OJA* 15 (1996) 158-159, and personal communication.

194 I. MORRIS, *Archaeology as Cultural History: Words and Things in Iron Age Greece* (2000) 235.

195 The same question of description vs. imitation arises in connection with the warrior burial at Eleutherna in Crete which, with its evidence of the sacrifice of an adult male and other Homeric features, may be thought to resemble epic rites just as closely (N. STAMPOLIDIS, "Eleutherna on Crete: An Interim Report on the Geometric-Archaic Cemetery," *BSA* 85 [1990] 375-403). The burial is dated 725-700 B.C. (where M.L. West would place the *Iliad* itself). Cretan pottery of the Archaic and Classical periods, unlike that of mainland Greece, does not depict Homeric episodes, however. Warrior burials continue in Euboea into the Geometric period at Eretria (B. BLANDIN, "Une tombe du IX^e siècle av. J.-C. à Erétrie," *AntK* 43 [2000] 134-146; A. MAZARAKIS-AINIAN, "The Archaeology of *Basileis*," in *Ancient Greece* [*supra* n. 33] 195). I. Morris concludes that "the epic was not some kind of bad history. It was a poetic creation, what some eighth-century Greeks thought the heroic world ought to have been like" (I. MORRIS, "Homer and the Iron Age," *New Companion to Homer* 558).

small bronze spearhead remained).¹⁹⁶ The existence in 14th to 13th century B.C. contexts of elite burials in special stone-built structures with weapons and large amounts of Mycenaean pottery (but in pottery kraters rather than metal urns) in mixed cremation and inhumation cemeteries at the Beşik Tepe cemetery of Troy and at Panaztepe and Bakla Tepe on the Anatolian coast was noted above.

It is also important to recall how atypical such burials are in Protogeometric Greece. Burials in general seem poor indeed.¹⁹⁷ In the 11th and early 10th centuries the rite of elaborate cremation burial may have been reserved for a warrior elite. Moreover, I. Morris among others has stressed that in general bronze and gold disappear from the archaeological record in Greece in the 10th century B.C., and that Greece appears to turn inward.¹⁹⁸ In this respect, the 11th and early 10th centuries B.C. appear a more appropriate setting for an expedition against Troy involving most areas of the Greek world than a time later in the Protogeometric. In Homer, weapons are made of bronze (except for the arrows in *Il.* 4.123 and a sword or knife in *Il.* 18.4, as A. Michailidou has kindly reminded me). Iron is in use for other purposes such as agricultural and craftsmen's tools. Weapons exclusively of bronze would be out of place in any period after the early to mid-11th century. Iron swords and daggers made for use (rather than for display, as in early examples with ivory handles and/or silver rivets) do not become frequent until the end of the 11th century,¹⁹⁹ around the time of the Toumba burial. Of course the poet may have deliberately introduced an archaizing heroic element in his descriptions of warfare. (Both Homer and Hesiod seem to have known that there was a time when weapons of bronze were used.) If allowance is granted for a substantial amount of poetic license with respect to the size of the Greek fleet and force, then the period of the establishment of the first Early Iron Age Greek settlements on the coast of Asia Minor seems an appropriate period for a series of skirmishes in the Troad. Northeast Greek ambitions in the area of the Troad seem likely, and in particular as regards the island of Lesbos. Janko notes that if anyone had the obvious motive for glorifying a panhellenic military expedition in the Troad, it was the Aeolians, and that epic diction may point in the same direction.²⁰⁰ The general correspondence between the milieu of Early Iron Age Greece and that of the epics has already been noted.

VII. Considerations Regarding the Role of Euboea

The role of Euboea, and particularly its maritime trading and colonizing, requires special consideration. The strait separating Euboea from the mainland, sheltered from most storms, provides a natural north-south trade route and intersects an east and west route as well. Access

196 For general discussion, see CRIELAARD (*supra* n. 164) 187-191; for Crete, see STAMPOLIDIS (*supra* n. 195) 375-403; for Cyprus, see MORRIS (*supra* n. 194) 271-272; J.N. COLDSTREAM, *Geometric Greece: 900-700 B.C.* (2003²) 349-350; and J. MUHLY, personal communication of 8 October 2006. For information on Kaloriziki Tomb 40 I am once again indebted to H.W. Catling.

197 The literature with respect to theoretical and methodological approaches to burial practices and rites is of course vast and its analysis and applications to Bronze Age or Iron Age Greece are beyond the scope of this paper. Of course it is always possible that simple burials reflect a change in burial practices with respect to the deposition of valuables rather than the absence of objects of intrinsic value in the society.

198 MORRIS (*supra* n. 189) 2, 4. The Toumba burial in contrast to others of its time raises important questions about the degree to which the wealth of the society was concentrated in the hands of a chieftain or a chieftain and his kin or clan. Recent Chieftain societies differ greatly in this respect. An extreme, not to say outré, example of concentration is provided by Equatorial Guinea, one of the poorest countries on earth, whose president is listed by Forbes as the world's eighth richest ruler with a net worth of \$600 million. His predecessor as president fled with \$60 million packed in suitcases, a sum equivalent to the nation's entire foreign exchange (N.D. KRISTOF, "Optimism and Africa," *New York Times*, 3 October 2006, 27). Of course the scale is completely different from Early Iron Age societies; the population of Equatorial Guinea in 2006 was 540,000 ("Equatorial Guinea," *The World Factbook* [<https://www.cia.gov/cia/publications/factbook/geos/ek.html>]). Other (and often smaller) Chieftain societies exist that are more egalitarian. In the *Iliad*, various of the leaders have great wealth (e.g., cities) at their disposal for use as gifts.

199 J. MUHLY, R. MADDIN, T. STECH and E. ÖZGEN, "Iron in Anatolia and the Nature of the Hittite Iron Industry," *AnatSt* 35 (1985) 68; O.T.P.K. DICKINSON, *The Aegean from Bronze Age to Iron Age: Continuity and Change Between the Twelfth and Eighth Centuries BC* (2006) 148-149.

200 JANKO (*supra* n. 16) 19.

to trade routes was critical to the prosperity of most Late Bronze Age and Early Iron Age societies. E. Hatzaki has noted that from Mount Dirfis on Euboea on a late March day at sunset, it is possible to see Mount Olympos, Chios, and even the Turkish coast.²⁰¹ Already in LH IIIC forty-eight out of a total of sixty-five known imports to Greece from Asia Minor come from sites in the area of the Euboean Gulf.²⁰² Euboean contacts with the Anatolian coast and the Aegean islands increase in the 11th century B.C. R. Catling holds that the example of Euboean pottery affects pottery production at Troy in Early and Middle Protogeometric periods and that a Euboean-centered pottery *koine* extends inland and to south Thessaly, where strong links exist with Iolkos and the Gulf of Pagasae from the mid-11th to the 9th century B.C.²⁰³ The earliest Iron Age pottery at Chios has Euboean characteristics; S. Hood has suggested a possible Euboean colonization of Chios.²⁰⁴ Euboean contacts are evident as well in the north Aegean, a region rich in metals and settings of myth. H.W. Catling quotes I. Vokotopoulou's note that the Submycenaean and Protogeometric pottery at the fortified site of Kalandra on Vigla, on the western and most fertile prong of the Chalcidice, has affinities with Lefkandi, suggesting a possible Euboean source for the founding of the settlement.²⁰⁵ West, Lemos and other scholars believe that Euboea was the most prosperous and progressive region in Greece in the 10th, 9th and 8th centuries B.C.²⁰⁶ Lefkandi-Xeropolis provides evidence of continuity of occupation through all phases of LH IIIC and on into the Protogeometric period.²⁰⁷

West, A.C. Cassio and others have noted the likely importance of Euboeans in the transmission of the epics, but put the period of Euboean influence on the epic language later in the 8th century B.C. around the time of the abandonment of Lefkandi, when the Euboean poleis of Eretria and Chalcis were prosperous.²⁰⁸ West argues that it is in Euboea where the Central and West Ionic forms in the epics would most easily have been added to the Aeolic, and that the Thessalian elements of the narrative would have been most easily accessible. He further suggests that there existed an 11th century B.C. Thessalian *Iliad* in the Aeolic dialect, out of which an 8th century partly Ionic *Iliad* developed through an accretion of additional subplots, episodes and characters.²⁰⁹ He adds that the comparative wealth of Euboea, stemming from its maritime ventures and early colonizing, would surely have attracted bards²¹⁰ (Hesiod recounts

- 201 E. HATZAKI quoted in A. ELDER, "New Curator Upholds British Tradition at Knossos," *Athens News*, 13 August 1999, 9.
- 202 E.H. CLINE, *Sailing the Wine-Dark Sea: International Trade in the Late Bronze Age Aegean* (1994) 16 table 6, 22 table 16; CRIELAARD (*supra* n. 186) 281; I. MORRIS, "Gift and Commodity in Archaic Greece," *Man* 21 (1986) 1-17.
- 203 R.W.V. CATLING, "The Typology of the Protogeometric and Subprotogeometric Pottery from Troia and Its Aegean Context," *Studia Troica* 8 (1998) 151-187.
- 204 HOOD (*supra* n. 176) 179-180. See above, p. 25-26.
- 205 I. VOKOTOPOULOU quoted in H.W. CATLING, "Kalandra," *AR* 35 (1989) 72; I. VOKOTOPOULOU, *To Αρχαιολογικό Έργο στη Μακεδονία και Θράκη* 1 (1987) 281.
- 206 E.g., LEMOS (*supra* n. 186) 212-217; WEST (*supra* n. 50) 151-172; Recent discoveries of apparent Euboean Protogeometric sherds by C. Doumet-Serhal at Sidon and the recent analysis by J. Coldstream of the material from Tel-Rehov in Israel have been seen as strengthening the case for a prominent Euboean role (C. DOUMET-SERHAL, "Sidon—British Museum Excavations 1998-2003," *Archaeology and History in Lebanon* 18 [2003] 2-19; COLDSTREAM [*supra* n. 196] 373; J.N. COLDSTREAM and A. MAZAR, "Greek Pottery from Tel Rehov and Iron Age Chronology," *IEJ* 53 (2003) 29-48; COOK [*supra* n. 46]). The resumption of excavations at Lefkandi by I.S. Lemos, the excavations begun at Karystos in southern Euboea by J. Wickens, and the excavations at Mitrou across the strait, plus the continuing excavations of F. Dakoronia in neighboring East Locris and Phocis and those of V. Adrymi-Sismani in the Volos area will shed further light on this question.
- 207 LEMOS (*supra* n. 186) 140.
- 208 WEST (*supra* n. 50) 151-172; A.C. CASSIO, "Early Editions of the Greek Epics and Homeric Textual Criticism in the Sixth and Fifth Centuries BC," in F. MONTANARI and P. ASCHERI (eds), *Omero tremila anni dopo* (2002) 108, 110-111.
- 209 An 11th century B.C. Thessalian Aeolic origin for the *Iliad* was already a feature of 19th century Homeric scholarship. See R.C. JEBB, *Homer: An Introduction to the "Iliad" and the "Odyssey"* (1894) 168 and P. CAUER, *Grundfragen der Homerkritik* (1895; 1909²), cited in R. DREWS, "Argos and Argives in the *Iliad*," *CP* 74 (1979) 112, who is of the same view. Drews further argues that even in LH IIIB at the end of the Palatial period life in Thessaly would have been more primitive than in southern Greece, and scribal literacy perhaps limited or nonexistent. The current excavations of V. Adrymi-Sismani at Dimini (Iolkos) indicate more complexity at least in southern Thessaly than was apparent when Drews wrote.
- 210 WEST (*supra* n. 50) 166-167.

how he competed along with other poets for prizes for poetry at funeral games offered by the sons of the king of Chalkis on Euboea²¹¹).

In the *Iliad* the Greek fleet assembles at the narrowest point of the Euripus between Aulis and Chalkis in Euboea and the Catalogue of Ships begins its account in Boeotia. (The *Odyssey* imagines Euboea as the farthest horizon of the Phaiakes.²¹²) The names of twenty-nine cities or towns in Boeotia and seven in Euboea are listed in the Catalogue, compared to only one—Athens—in Attica. Of course many regard the Catalogue as a 7th century B.C. insertion (if not part of an epic composed essentially in the 7th century).²¹³ That it is impossible in general to match the sites listed in the Catalogue with known Bronze Age sites has been shown by O. Dickinson.²¹⁴ The twin origins of the Catalogue in myth and contemporary importance in the Geometric period are considered in detail by E. Visser.²¹⁵ Euboea's eastern trading ventures render it a likely potential gathering point for the reflections of Eastern myths in the epics.²¹⁶ No one from Euboea plays a prominent role in the *Iliad* or *Odyssey*, however, perhaps suggesting that the personae of the tales became fixed at a time prior to the florescence of Euboea in the Early Iron Age. Janko and others of course posit an earlier fixing of the epic *Kunstsprache*, as noted above.

With regard to the putative role of Euboea, together with East Locris and Phocis across the strait, in the creation and dissemination of the epics, a final observation is in order. J.P. Crielaard argues that this area and central Greece in general display a higher degree of continuity from the Bronze Age through the Early Iron Age than other areas of Greece.²¹⁷ In the past two years the ongoing excavations at Mitrou have provided additional evidence for occupation in LH IIIC and the Early Iron Age.²¹⁸ Recent evidence for continuity from Elateia and Kalapodi is noted above. However, excavations and reanalyses of past finds also indicate a greater degree of continuity of occupation than previously supposed at Knossos, Thebes, Athens and Pylos. Knossos was more or less continuously inhabited throughout the Bronze Age and through the Geometric period, although there are notable lacunae in many areas of the site in LM IIIB.²¹⁹ At Thebes, the cemetery at Tachi (ancient Potniai) has yielded burials from all periods from LH IIIA to late Geometric.²²⁰ At Athens, a long chain of burials may be traced on the south slope of Philopappos Hill and on the north bank of the Ilissos River. Chamber tombs which begin in LH IIA continue into IIIC Middle and there are Submycenaean and Early Iron Age burials also.²²¹ At Pylos, investigations in the past year by J. Davis provided evidence of pottery of all Early Iron Age phases at or near the palace, opening the possibility that occupation of the ridge of Ano Englianos, together with knowledge of the prior presence of a palatial building, continued into the 8th century B.C.²²² Ongoing work at Pylos will shed further light in this regard. I. Morris contends, however, that the emergence of the Chieftain society exemplified by the rites and rituals suggested by the Toumba burial on Lefkandi signals a change in societal structure, notwithstanding deliberate reference to the heroic past and whatever the continuity of occupation. At many sites, moreover, the use of a burial ground with a Bronze Age origin stops and a new cemetery at another location is begun near the start of the Protogeometric period, sometimes with new burial practices.

211 Hesiod, *Works and Days* 655-660.

212 *Od.* 7.321-326.

213 WEST (*supra* n. 50) 168 vs. G.J. HUXLEY, "Numbers in the Homeric Catalogue of Ships," *GRBS* 7 (1966) 318.

214 DICKINSON (*supra* n. 20) 207-210.

215 E. VISSER, *Homers Katalog der Schiffe* (1997).

216 The excavations at Lefkandi have produced the earliest known depiction of a centaur, with an indication of a branch and a possible wound on a leg, dated to c. 900-825 B.C. (LEMOS [*supra* n. 186] 98). Similar figures exist in Attica (ANTONACCIO [*supra* n. 192] 17 and n. 55).

217 CRIELAARD (*supra* n. 186) 284.

218 ZAHOU and VAN DE MOORTELE quoted in WHITLEY (*supra* n. 167) 53.

219 COLDSTREAM (*supra* n. 60) 581-582.

220 V. ARAVANTINOS, personal communication.

221 I. LEMOS, "Athens and Lefkandi: A Tale of Two Sites," in *Ancient Greece* (*supra* n. 33) 507.

222 J. DAVIS, personal communication, for which I am most grateful. By the first century B.C., the location of Homeric Pylos was in dispute (Strabo, 8.3.7: "There is a Pylos before Pylos, and there is yet another Pylos").

VIII. Concluding Comments

Of course the fact that pottery of each Late Bronze and Early Iron Age stylistic phase is present at a site is no guarantee of continuity of occupation, let alone that those responsible for the deposits constituted an ongoing community of myth and memory. Population replacement is seldom total, however, and even remnants of conquered populations taken into slavery may cling to memories and songs over generations. Perhaps more significantly, oral traditions may acquire particular importance as a result of a diaspora. Shrine sites where pottery and other deposits of all periods are represented in quantity, such as Kato Syme in Crete or Kalapodi, may present the strongest case for continuity.²²³ In general with regard to the possibility of continuous oral transmission of Homeric passages over many centuries, it is prudent both to acknowledge the extent of the disruptions to society at the end of the full Palatial period and again at the end of IIC or Subminoan/Submycenaean, as well as the disruption caused by the various migrations (for people do not leave their homelands without good reason), but also to reorganize the possible avenues and venues for elements of continuity amid change, as noted above.

This paper seeks to apply new evidence (including in particular new information from Hittite texts and recent archaeological excavations in coastal Asia Minor and north-central Greece) to enduring Homeric questions. To some, of course, any discussion of possible elements of historicity in the Homeric epics provides an example of the credulous in pursuit of the tenuous, futilely attempting to circumscribe chronologically the imagination of the poet. Indeed, it is even possible that a Mycenaean-led Greek coalition attacked Troy during the Bronze Age but that bards of the 9th-8th century B.C. with no inherited knowledge of the event, inspired by the still visible and grandly evocative walls of Mycenaean and Troy (and informed by Bronze Age heirlooms), independently created majestic epics about a Trojan war and the return of heroes, set in a milieu comprehensible to the audiences of their day. Let us then yield to temptation and close our male-centered discussion with a comment on the role of Helen. Rationalist historians have envisioned a putative Trojan war as a struggle over trade routes to the Black Sea or as a raid of the Sea Peoples, rather than an effort to recapture an errant wife. Near Eastern texts at the end of the Bronze Age suggest that the Homeric version cannot be totally dismissed, however. J. Sasson observes that:

The second millennium before Christ seems to have been a period when a veritable epidemic of run-away wives plagued the various civilizations. Powerful, sea-oriented kingdoms relied on their navies to retrieve the errant spouses. RS 18.06 points out how "Ammistamru II, King of Ugarit, prepared ships and troops in order to capture and punish the sinful wife."²²⁴

To a Bronze Age or Early Iron Age audience, the story of Helen and the great expedition to reclaim her may not have seemed strange at all.

Malcolm H. WIENER

²²³ Of course even proven continuity of use of a shrine is no guarantee of continuity of ritual, myth or memory—consider the conversion of Hagia Sophia in Istanbul into a mosque. In this connection, the caution of C. Morgan is apt: "There seems little to commend the idea of cult continuity as it is often presented. Simply to treat any shrine with evidence of pre-Protogeometric origins (and in practice this generally means LH IIC or Post-palatial) as representative of 'continuity' is meaningless, not least because it avoids the central issue of the development of religious institutions within a changing society (and here I leave aside the parallel question of the historiography of myths of origin). If we are to understand the developments in the material expression of religious belief, the central problem must be the nature of ritual tradition, the acquisition and transmission of cult knowledge and the practices associated with it, and its operation in the varied social circumstances of the fragmenting Late Bronze/Early Iron Age world" (MORGAN [*supra* n. 175] 43). See also C. MORGAN, *Early Greek States Beyond the Polis* (2003) 107-163.

²²⁴ J. SASSON, "Canaanite Maritime Involvement in the Second Millennium," *JAOs* 86 (1966) 137.

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

- Pl. I Map of Mediterranean region showing areas and territories mentioned in the text.
Pl. IIa Map of Greece, showing sites mentioned in the text.
Pl. IIb Map of East Greece and Anatolia, showing sites mentioned in the text.

ABBREVIATIONS

- Aegean Painting* S.A. IMMERWAHR, *Aegean Painting in the Bronze Age* (1990).
- Ages of Homer* J.B. CARTER and S.P. MORRIS (eds), *The Ages of Homer: A Tribute to Emily Townsend Vermuele* (1995).
- EIKON* R. LAFFINEUR and J.L. CROWLEY (eds), *EIKΩN. Aegean Bronze Age Iconography: Shaping a Methodology. Proceedings of the 4th International Aegean Conference, University of Tasmania, Hobart, Australia 6–9 April 1992, Aegaeum 8* (1992).
- Mauerschau* R. ASLAN, S. BLUM, G. KASTL, F. SCHWEIZER and D. THUMM (eds), *Mauerschau. Festschrift für Manfred Korfmann* (2002).
- MELETEMATA* Ph. BETANCOURT, V. KARAGEORGHIS, R. LAFFINEUR and W.-D. NIEMEIER (eds), *MELETEMATA. Studies in Aegean Archaeology Presented to Malcolm H. Wiener as he enters his 65th Year, Aegaeum 20* (1999).
- Minoan Thalassocracy* R. HÄGG and N. MARINATOS (eds), *The Minoan Thalassocracy: Myth and Reality. Proceedings of the Third International Symposium at the Swedish Institute in Athens (31 May – 5 June 1982)* (1984).
- New Companion to Homer* I. MORRIS and B. POWELL (eds), *A New Companion to Homer* (1997).
- POLITEIA* R. LAFFINEUR and W.-D. NIEMEIER (eds), *POLITEIA. Society and State in the Aegean Bronze Age. Proceedings of the 5th International Aegean Conference, University of Heidelberg, Archäologisches Institut, 10–13 April 1994, Aegaeum 12* (1995).
- TEXNH* R. LAFFINEUR and Ph. BETANCOURT (eds), *TEXNH. Craftsmen, Craftswomen, and Craftmanship in the Aegean Bronze Age, Proceedings of the 6th International Aegean Conference, Philadelphia, Temple Univ., 18–21 April 1996, Aegaeum 16* (1997).